



COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

* * * * *

IN RE: PROPOSED RULEMAKING: CO2 BUDGET TRADING
PROGRAM

* * * * *

BEFORE: JESSICA SHIRLEY, Chair

DAREK JAGIELA, Member

LAURA GRIFFIN, Member

SARAH PINTER, Member

JENNIFER SWAN, Panelist

HEARING: Monday, December 14, 2020

6:00 p.m.

LOCATION: Webex Video Conference

WITNESSES: Meryl Sands, Nadyenka McIntosh, Kathy

Greely, Kolya Shields, Annalise Stein, Lily

Dickason, Alex Charlton, Kyle Rivers, Kristen

Nichols, Ella Henderson, Margherita Abe, Dan Smith,

Kaitlyn Wagner, Juan Llarena, Brandon Hoover,

Geoffrey Selling, Wendy Greenspan, Roger Clark, C.

Ben Vila, Laura Murillo, Desiree Carbone, Russell

Any reproduction of this transcript
is prohibited without authorization
by the certifying agency

WITNESSES: Golman, Kolson Schlosser, William Sabey,
Anna Loudenslager, Kelly Finan, Char Magaro, Lauren
Kahn, Morton Rubenstein, Georgia Murray, Tom Pike,
Sara Innamorato, Magdalena Sikora, Stephanie Ulmer,
Richard Marcil, William Berg, Mark Smith, David
Thomas Roberts, R. Scott Brown, Steven Clark,
Charmaine Butler, Teresa Caruthers, Annie
Guadagnino, Marc Karasek, Jaret Gibbons, Susan
Loucks, Andrea Strout, Ayres Freitas, Kathy Pollard,
Ella Graban

Reporter: Kelly Gallick

I N D E X

1		
2		
3	OPENING REMARKS	
4	By Ms. Shirley	7 - 12
5	PUBLIC REMARKS	
6	By Meryl Sands	12 - 16
7	By Nadyenka McIntosh	16 - 18
8	By Kathy Greely	19 - 23
9	By Kolya Shields	24 - 26
10	By Annalise Stein	26 - 29
11	By Lily Dickason	29 - 33
12	By Alex Charlton	33 - 36
13	By Kyle Rivers	36 - 40
14	By Kristen Nichols	40 - 44
15	By Ella Henderson	44 - 47
16	By Margherita Abe	47 - 49
17	By Dan Smith	49 - 54
18	By Kaitlyn Wagner	54 - 57
19	By Juan Liarena	57 - 58
20	By Brandon Hoover	59 - 62
21	By Geoffrey Selling	62 - 66
22	By Wendy Greenspan	66 - 70
23	By Roger Clark	70 - 73
24	By C. Ben Vila	73 - 78
25	By Laura Murillo	79 - 82

I N D E X (continued)

1		
2		
3	By Desiree Carbone	83 - 85
4	By Russell Golman	86 - 88
5	By Kolson Schlosser	89 - 92
6	By William Sabey	92 - 95
7	By Anna Loudenslager	96 - 98
8	By Kelly Finan	98 - 99
9	By Char Magaro	99 - 102
10	By Lauren Kahn	102 - 106
11	By Morton Rubenstein	106 - 108
12	By Georgia Murray	109 - 112
13	By Tom Pike	113 - 115
14	By Sara Innamorato	116 - 119
15	By Magdalena Sikora	120 - 124
16	By Stephanie Ulmer	124 - 127
17	By Richard Marcil	127 - 132
18	By William Berg	132 - 133
19	By Mark Smith	134 - 137
20	By David Thomas Roberts	138 - 142
21	By R. Scott Brown	142 - 146
22	By Steven Clark	146 - 149
23	By Charmaine Butler	149 - 152
24	Teresa Caruthers	153 - 156
25	By Annie Guadagnino	156 - 159

I N D E X

1		
2		
3	By Marc Karasek	159 - 162
4	By Jaret Gibbons	163 - 166
5	By Susan Loucks	166 - 170
6	By Andrea Strout	171 - 173
7	By Ayres Freitas	174 - 177
8	By Kathy Pollard	178 - 182
9	By Ella Graban	182 - 185
10	DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES	185 - 187
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

E X H I B I T S

		Page	Page
<u>Number</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Offered</u>	<u>Admitted</u>
	NONE OFFERED		

P R O C E E D I N G S

MS. SHIRLEY: Good evening. I would like to welcome you to the Environmental Quality Board, EQB's, public hearing on the proposed rulemaking for the Pennsylvania CO2 Budget Trading Program.

My name is Jessica Shirley and I'm the policy director for the Department of Environmental Protection. I am facilitating this hearing on behalf of the Environmental Quality Board.

Assisting me today is Darek Jagiela, our host, Laura Griffin, DEP's regulatory coordinator, Sarah Pinter, an executive policy specialist at DEP, and Jennifer Swan, who most of you corresponded with to register for this hearing.

I officially call this hearing to order at 6:01 p.m. This public hearing will be recorded in its entirety. Additionally, a stenographer will be transcribing this hearing.

The purpose of this hearing is to formally accept testimony on the proposed rulemaking. This proposed rulemaking was adopted by the EQB at its meeting on September 15th, 2020. It proposes to establish a program to limit carbon

1 dioxide, or CO₂, emissions for fossil fuel fired
2 power plants located in Pennsylvania with an
3 electricity generation capacity equal to or greater
4 than 25 megawatts.

5 The purpose of this proposed
6 rulemaking is to reduce CO₂ emissions, which is a
7 greenhouse gas and major contributor to climate
8 change impacts, in a manner that protects public
9 health, welfare, and the environment.

10 Under the authority of Pennsylvania's
11 Air Pollution Control Act, the proposed rulemaking
12 would establish Pennsylvania's participation in the
13 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, or RGGI, a
14 regional CO₂ budget trading program.

15 In addition to reducing CO₂ emissions,
16 Pennsylvania will also see a decrease in harmful
17 NO_x, SO₂, and particulate matter emissions as well
18 as ground-level ozone pollution. Human exposure to
19 these air pollutants contributes to respiratory and
20 cardiovascular health problems including asthma,
21 bronchitis, heart attacks and strokes.

22 By participating in RGGI, DEP
23 estimates that Pennsylvania will see CO₂ emission
24 reductions of around 188 million tons by 2030. This
25 concludes the summary of the rulemaking.

1 If you would like to access a more
2 detailed explanation of regulatory amendments
3 included in this rulemaking, you can visit eComment
4 on DEP's web page and select regulations.

5 In order to give everyone an equal
6 opportunity to comment on this proposal, I would
7 like to establish the following ground rules. Sarah
8 is going to provide some of this information in the
9 chat box, so you don't need to write everything
10 down. I will call upon the witnesses who have signed
11 up to testify at this hearing.

12 All who signed up were assigned a
13 number indicating the order in which witnesses will
14 be called to speak. Only those who signed up by
15 contacting Jennifer Swan as indicated on the EQB web
16 page will be called upon to provide testimony.

17 When you are called, your line will be
18 unmuted. Testimony is limited to five minutes for
19 each witness and I will have a timer on the screen.
20 Please note that written and spoken testimony carry
21 the same weight.

22 If you should run out of time for your
23 spoken testimony, we will read the rest of your
24 comments from your written testimony. As advised in
25 registration correspondence, please provide a copy

1 of your written testimony to regcomments@pa.gov.

2 Your email must note that you are
3 submitting testimony for proposed rulemaking CO2
4 budget training program along with the following
5 information: your first and last name, your mailing
6 address, your email address, and if you are
7 commenting on behalf of an organization.

8 Testimony is not required to be five
9 minutes long. If others who provide testimony
10 before you are making similar statements to yours,
11 you are free to shorten or summarize your verbal
12 testimony at this time and still provide your full
13 testimony by email. This will allow us to hear from
14 more commenters at this hearing.

15 Through the signup process,
16 prospective commenters were requested to designate
17 one witness to present testimony on behalf of an
18 organization. Please state your name and address,
19 the city and state are sufficient, and affiliation,
20 if you have one, for the record prior to presenting
21 your testimony. The EQB would appreciate your help
22 by spelling out your name and terms that may not be
23 generally familiar, so that the transcript can be as
24 accurate as possible.

25 Because the purpose of this hearing is

1 to receive comments on the proposal, EQB members or
2 DEP staff cannot address questions about the
3 proposed rulemaking during the duration of the
4 hearing.

5 In addition to or in place of verbal
6 testimony presented at today's hearing, interested
7 persons may also submit written comments on this
8 proposal. Again, written and verbal comments hold
9 the same weight when considered in the finalization
10 of this proposed rulemaking.

11 All testimony and written comments
12 provided become part of the official public record.
13 All comments must be received by the EQB on or
14 before January 14th, 2021. There are a few ways to
15 submit written comments. Comments may be submitted
16 online through eComment, accessible from DEP's
17 website by clicking the eComment icon near the top
18 of DEP's homepage, www.dep.pa.gov, or comments may
19 be submitted by email at regcomments@pa.gov.

20 All comments are entered into eComment
21 and are accessible to the public. A subject heading
22 of the proposed rulemaking and a return name and
23 address must be included in each email. Comments
24 may also be sent through the US postal mail
25 addressed to the Environmental Quality Board, P.O.

1 Box 8477, Harrisburg, PA 17105-8477.

2 All testimony received at this hearing
3 as well as written comments received by January
4 14th, 2021 will be considered by the EQB and will be
5 included in a comment and response document which
6 will be prepared by DEP and reviewed by the EQB
7 prior to the board taking its final action on this
8 regulation.

9 Now I'm going to share my screen and
10 call for the first comment. All right.

11 First up we have number one, Meryl
12 Sands.

13 Do we have Meryl on the line?

14 MS. SANDS: Hi.

15 MS. SHIRLEY: Hello. You can begin.

16 MS. SANDS: Great.

17 My name is E. Meryl M-E-R-Y-L Sands
18 S-A-N-D-S and I'm a resident of Philadelphia,
19 Pennsylvania. Thank you for the opportunity to
20 speak at this virtual public hearing.

21 Climate change is one of the greatest
22 threats we face. Here in Pennsylvania, we are
23 already experiencing the effects. Stronger storms
24 and more flooding are straining our infrastructure
25 and our budgets.

1 For example PennDOT spent more than
2 \$125 million in 2018 alone to repair flooding and
3 landslide damage. Power outages hit a record high
4 in 2019 disrupting electricity for nearly two
5 million customers. This year was no different with
6 at least \$20 billion in weather damage nationwide.

7 Temperatures in Pennsylvania are
8 projected to increase by 5.4 degrees by 2050 and the
9 number of days with a heat index above 90 degrees
10 will increase dramatically from 8 to 40 per year.
11 This will have an enormous impact on our farmers,
12 especially dairy farmers.

13 High temperatures also have an undue
14 health effect on those in cities, especially those
15 without access to green space or air conditioning.
16 Speaking from personal experience, I worked outdoors
17 in Philadelphia for four summers, from 2014 to 2019.
18 I quickly learned the difference between working in
19 a green space, whether it'd be a park or just a
20 sidewalk with a tree and a parking lot or brown
21 space.

22 I learned the importance of sunscreen,
23 hydration and hats. But despite these efforts, by
24 2018, I knew that continuing to work outdoors was
25 unsustainable for me due to the risks and effects of

1 heat exhaustion, which I experienced multiple times.

2

3 These risks increase with the
4 intensity of the type of labor, the ability to take
5 breaks from the heat, and certain medications that
6 increase sensitivity to the sun. In Philadelphia,
7 many neighborhoods lack tree cover and as a result
8 have temperatures that are 22 degree higher.

9 These neighborhoods are more likely to
10 be neighborhoods of color with higher asthma rates.
11 Montelukast sodium is a common asthma medication
12 which, you guessed it, has increased sun sensitivity
13 as a side effect. Climate change is also
14 contributing to increases in Lyme disease and West
15 Nile virus and other tick and mosquito-borne
16 illnesses.

17 Heat-related deaths are on the rise
18 along with an increase in respiratory ailments like
19 asthma. These both disproportionately affect our
20 children and our elderly.

21 Unfortunately, Pennsylvania is
22 contributing to climate change because it is the
23 third largest producer of carbon pollution in the
24 country. It's time for Pennsylvania to get on board
25 with a proven program to reduce carbon pollution and

1 create thousands of jobs and join the bipartisan
2 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative or RGGI.

3 RGGI has been an enormous success in
4 the states where it is in place, fighting climate
5 pollution by a third and raising nearly \$3 billion
6 to invest in clean energy and other purposes.

7 Pennsylvania could receive hundreds of
8 millions of dollars in proceeds as well. These
9 funds would be invested in targeted efforts to
10 eliminate air pollution, start job creation, support
11 working Pennsylvanians and help boost the state's
12 long term economic recovery from the Covid-19
13 pandemic.

14 Expert analysis conducted for DEP
15 confirmed that RGGI would produce a net increase of
16 27,000 jobs and add \$1.9 billion to our state's
17 economy. Participation in RGGI will also make our
18 citizens healthier.

19 DEP analysis concluded that overall
20 carbon emissions will be cut by more than 180
21 million tons from 2022 to 2030. Hard coal sulfur
22 dioxide and nitrogen oxide emissions will be cut as
23 well. That will produce \$6.3 billion in health care
24 savings and 30,000 fewer hospital visits for
25 respiratory illnesses like asthma among children and

1 adults. There will also be 45,000 fewer asthma
2 attacks and 1,000 fewer cases of childhood
3 bronchitis.

4 Pennsylvanians want their lawmakers to
5 address climate change. Polling shows that three in
6 four Pennsylvanians support reducing carbon
7 pollution from power plants and want their
8 electricity to come from clean energy sources that
9 do not create carbon pollution. Businesses large
10 and small are on board as well and support RGGI's
11 market-based approach.

12 Thank you for considering my
13 testimony. In summary, RGGI is the market-based,
14 job-creating, proven tool for Pennsylvania to tackle
15 the problems that climate change presents. I yield
16 the remainder of my time.

17 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you.

18 Next we have number two, Nadyenka
19 McIntosh.

20 MS. MCINTOSH: Okay. Hello everyone.

21 My name is Nadyenka McIntosh and I'm
22 very thankful to be here today to talk about the
23 Regional Greenhouse Initiative or RGGI.

24 I am a current student at Temple
25 University in the College of Public Health. Even

1 though I'm not the most well-versed on all
2 environmental issues today, I do know that
3 everybody's health and safety relies on cleaner air
4 initiatives like RGGI now more than ever.

5 As years go by, we continue to push
6 for stronger efforts to go green, become more
7 environmentally friendly and conscience and
8 sustainable. And RGGI does exactly that.

9 As you all know, RGGI is a program
10 currently consisting of 10 mid-Atlantic and
11 northeastern states that are working toward CO2
12 emissions in an economical way. However, today I
13 want to highlight communities that have been
14 consistently ignored and face the burdens of
15 environmental injustice.

16 Low income and communities of color
17 are constantly left out in the conversation when it
18 comes to the environment and policies, although they
19 are also some of the communities that are impacted
20 the most. African-Americans and other people of
21 color are more likely to live in areas impacted by
22 dangerous waste pollute --- by dangerous wastes and
23 air pollution because of neighboring facilities.

24 In 2019, the American Lung Association
25 warned people here in Philadelphia --- in the

1 Philadelphia area that air --- that the air they
2 breathe is putting their health at risk. As a
3 result of this pollution, people in these
4 communities are at higher risk of asthma, heart
5 disease, cancer and premature death.

6 However, RGGI efforts have been shown
7 to help combat this issue. A Columbia University
8 study showed that the reduction in the air pollution
9 contributed by RGGI has also been able to reduce the
10 impacts on children's health. These communities all
11 around Pennsylvania can see great health benefits
12 from this program, not just privileged communities
13 are lucky enough to breathe cleaner air. A
14 sustainable future is not truly one if everybody is
15 not accounted for.

16 I'll also mention that the Regional
17 Greenhouse Gas Initiative seems to appeal to a
18 future that a lot of Americans in Pennsylvania are
19 looking forward to. RGGI is a cost-effective
20 approach that red, blue, and purple states have
21 implemented as well as the fact that in recent
22 polls, 72 percent of Philadelphia voters support
23 RGGI and 80 percent want to see regulations reducing
24 carbon dioxide emissions.

25 Thank you.

1 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you.

2 Next, we have number three, Kira
3 Sedberry. Do we have Kira?

4 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see Kira on the
5 line.

6 MS. SHIRLEY: All right.
7 How about number four, Erik Mitchell?

8 MR. JAGIELA: I don't see Erik on the
9 line either.

10 MS. SHIRLEY: All right.
11 How about number five, Kathy Greely?

12 MS. GREELY: Hi.

13 MS. SHIRLEY: Hi.

14 MS. GREELY: Can you hear me?

15 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes, we can. You can
16 start your testimony.

17 MS. GREELY: Okay. Give me one
18 second. I was trying to multitask and make dinner
19 at the same time. You guys were too quick. Okay.
20 Thank you.

21 My name is Kathy Greely. I'm
22 testifying on behalf of Performance Systems
23 Development and St. Martin-In-The-Fields Episcopal
24 Church. I'm located in Philadelphia.

25 And so my company Performance Systems

1 Development does energy efficiency work in the State
2 of Pennsylvania. As I mentioned, I'm also here
3 talking on behalf of my parish, St. Martin-In-The-
4 Fields. We're a parish of over 900 in Philly, where
5 I lead the climate action team which spearheads
6 activities ranging from improving the church's
7 physical clamp to educating parishioners on the
8 impact of and ways to respond to climate change.

9 A little background on my company,
10 Performance Systems Development, or PSD, is an
11 industry leader in the delivery of energy efficiency
12 programs, hiring our very first employee in
13 Pennsylvania back in 2007, and we now have over 20
14 staff here in the Keystone state with offices in
15 Philadelphia, Harrisburg and Meadville supporting
16 the new construction rebate and energy audit
17 programs for utilities such as PECO, PPL, First
18 Energy, UGI, and PGW as well as doing low income
19 weatherization training and quality assurance
20 inspections for First Energy, PECO and PGW.

21 In total, PSD has 65 employees across
22 the Northeast and Midwest, including program
23 administrators, engineers, trainers, building
24 scientists and software developers. We also work
25 with a number of trade allies in the state including

1 doing energy trades training benefits supported by
2 Pennsylvania's DEP allocated state energy project
3 funds. We work with about 250 builders that we call
4 contractors and over 1,000 code officials across the
5 state and we're a registered small business with the
6 US Small Business Administration.

7 I'm here to voice strong support for
8 RGGI on behalf of both Pennsylvania's business and
9 religious community and to encourage the DEP to
10 implement a RGGI ruling that prioritizes energy
11 efficiency investments for four primary reasons.

12 The first is that RGGI investments in
13 efficiency will encourage innovation and economic
14 growth. Cap-and-invest programs like RGGI allow the
15 market to determine the best means of reducing
16 carbon emissions. Other participating RGGI states
17 have invested over half their proceeds into
18 efficiency generating over \$4 million in economic
19 benefits including new jobs and utility bill savings
20 for consumers and businesses.

21 Secondly, it's important to note that
22 investing RGGI proceeds in energy efficiency can
23 help make the energy landscape more equitable.
24 Support for low and moderate income customers and
25 for small businesses is especially critical right

1 now. And RGGI money could be used to help fill the
2 gaps in existing low income and small business
3 efficiency programs by extending the incentives for
4 increased efficiency to homes and businesses that
5 use fuel oil, propane, wood and natural gas; all
6 fuel types that are not covered by the Act 129
7 efficiency programs in our state.

8 Third reason, investing RGGI proceeds
9 in energy efficiency will create jobs. Energy
10 efficiency is one of the biggest, most reliable job
11 creators among all the energy sectors. Once
12 Pennsylvania officially joins RGGI, efficiency
13 workers will be at increased demand to build,
14 install, monitor and repair and improve equipment.
15 And these jobs offer higher than average salaries
16 and they cannot be outsourced. They have to be
17 placed here in Pennsylvania.

18 Pennsylvania could also use funds to
19 develop training centers and career pathways in
20 vocational and community schools across the state
21 using RGGI proceeds.

22 And finally, RGGI can play an
23 important role in strengthening Pennsylvania's
24 stance on environmental justice for the poor. As a
25 person of faith, I believe we have a responsibility

1 to support the most vulnerable among us. The
2 impacts of climate change things like heat waves,
3 violent storms and spreading disease fall most
4 heavily on those with the fewest resources.

5 One of my grad school professors once
6 said our response to climate change will be a mix of
7 mitigation, adaptation, and suffering. It is up to
8 us to determine what that mix will be. Today, we
9 have an opportunity to minimize the suffering of
10 Pennsylvanians by using RGGI science to mitigate
11 carbon emissions and adapt our workforce for a
12 stable future.

13 I encourage the DEP to act quickly to
14 develop a RGGI rule that prioritizes investments in
15 efficiency which will lower customer bills, reduce
16 emissions, create jobs and power Pennsylvania's
17 economic recovery.

18 Thank you for your time and this
19 opportunity to share the perspectives of my company
20 --- my company and my faith community.

21 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Kathy.
22 Hopefully you didn't burn your dinner.

23 MS. GREELY: I did not.
24 Thank you.

25 MS. SHIRLEY: Next up, we have number

1 six, Kolya Shields.

2 MS. SHIELDS: Hello, yes.

3 MS. SHIRLEY: You can begin.

4 MS. SHIELDS: I'm Kolya Shields that's
5 spelled K-O-L-Y-A S-H-I-E-L-D-S.

6 Let's see. I'm at 126 Highland Ave.
7 in Arlington, Massachusetts and good evening and
8 thank you for the opportunity to testify today.

9 My name is Kolya Shields and I'm a
10 college student who's living in the Boston area
11 studying geography and environmental science at
12 Brown University. At our current pace of pollution
13 and aggressive climate change, estimates show that
14 sea level rise will submerge much of Boston by the
15 end of this century.

16 Effects of climate change exist across
17 the country and the region. Temperature rise means
18 more pests and bugs across the Northeast which means
19 Pennsylvania will experience higher risk of the EEE
20 virus and more heavier rain events and heat stress
21 that will lead to decline in agricultural production
22 across the state.

23 I want to be able to safely share this
24 special country and region with my future kids which
25 means we need smart climate action now.

1 Here in Massachusetts, I'm lucky to be
2 in a state that's working to ensure our future and
3 protect the places that we care about. We've been a
4 part of this bipartisan Regional Greenhouse Gas
5 Initiative for over ten years. And this program now
6 includes the rest of the northeastern states and
7 soon Virginia as well. As part of this program and
8 with further legislation, we've reduced the carbon
9 pollution in Massachusetts by almost a quarter and
10 by almost a half in all the RGGI states combined.

11 We've raised \$250 million with RGGI,
12 which has been used on energy efficiency investments
13 that create hundreds of jobs while creating lots of
14 --- while helping Massachusettsians keep their homes
15 with less energy and lower fuel costs, saving money.

16 This has helped economic growth in RGGI states, and
17 Massachusetts has outpaced the country by 31
18 percent.

19 And this even helps clean up our air,
20 allowing me to walk out from my home and breathe in
21 deeply, unafraid of smog and haze. Pennsylvania
22 would benefit greatly from all of RGGI's successes.

23 Now Pennsylvania is the fourth largest
24 climate polluter in the country which does mean ---
25 which means that if Pennsylvania tackles it's

1 pollution, it can make a massive difference in
2 fighting climate change and creating a safe, healthy
3 future for all.

4 So if Pennsylvania acts now and joins
5 RGGI, the Commonwealth can give millions of young
6 people around the state and the country hope for the
7 future. Hope that they'll be able to breathe clean
8 air and show their future kids the places that mean
9 so much to them. Large swaths of Philly including
10 many parts of south Philly and FDR Park could be
11 under water by 2100.

12 And increased precipitation and
13 flooding from climate change will cause millions of
14 dollars in infrastructure damages all across
15 Pennsylvania. But joining RGGI is the first step to
16 letting me walk down the Boston and the Philly
17 waterfront and feel hopeful for our future,
18 confident in our economy weathering these impacts of
19 climate change, and secure in these places of
20 safety. Thank you.

21 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you.

22 Next, we have number seven, Annalise
23 Stein.

24 MS. STEIN: Hi.

25 MS. SHIRLEY: Hi.

1 MS. STEIN: My name is Annalise Stein
2 A-N-N-A-L-I-S-E Stein S-T-E-I-N. I'm from
3 Washington Crossing, Pennsylvania.

4 Thank you for this opportunity to
5 comment on RGGI, the Regional Greenhouse Gas
6 Initiative. I'm currently a student at DePaul
7 University where I major in romance languages and
8 minor in political science and English literature.

9 I'm planning on going to graduate
10 school for environmental policy to guide the
11 necessary changes the United States and the world as
12 a whole need to make in order to protect our
13 environment and ensure that we have a safe livable
14 climate for generations to come.

15 As a resident of Pennsylvania, I can
16 see the visual impacts of climate change over the
17 past 21 years and the immediate need to reduce our
18 impact on the climate crisis by joining RGGI. When
19 I was younger, I used to ski in the Poconos with my
20 family. However, each year we were unable to ski
21 until later in the year due to the lack of snow.

22 The Pennsylvania Department of
23 Environmental Protection notes that the temperature
24 in Pennsylvania has increased 1.8 degrees Fahrenheit
25 in the past century and will only continue to rise.

1 Pennsylvania as one of the largest
2 greenhouse gas emitters in the country has a
3 responsibility to be a leader in implementing
4 climate solutions and reducing emissions. By
5 joining RGGI, we cannot only reduce our climate
6 pollution but also harmful air pollution that puts
7 our health at risk. I wake up every day and check
8 my weather app. More times than not, the app states
9 that there is poor air quality which may impact some
10 people including my cousin who has asthma. It is
11 much harder for him to enjoy his normal activities
12 like playing soccer outside due to the poor air
13 quality.

14 What's sad is that many cities across
15 Pennsylvania have poor air quality which affects
16 children, seniors as well as low-income and
17 environmental justice communities. Joining RGGI
18 will not only allow Pennsylvania to reduce our
19 climate --- our impact on climate change and help to
20 clean up our air but it will also help us become
21 more energy efficient.

22 The program has raised over \$2.5
23 billion in the participating states for energy
24 efficiency and renewable energy projects, greenhouse
25 gas abatement and direct bill assistance. Joining

1 RGGI would be very beneficial to me, my community as
2 well as Pennsylvania and all of its residents.

3 I want my future to be filled with
4 clean air, improved public health, and less
5 pollution overall. However, this is impossible if
6 we don't take the steps today to reduce carbon
7 pollution from all of our states' power plants.

8 I strongly urge you to approve the
9 plan for Pennsylvania to join RGGI to allow for caps
10 on pollution, reduced emissions as well as clean air
11 for everyone. I yield the rest of my time.

12 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Annalise.

13 Next, we have number eight, Lily
14 Dickason.

15 MS. DICKASON: Hello.

16 MS. SHIRLEY: Hi, Lily.

17 MS. DICKASON: My name is Lily
18 Dickason spelled L-I-L-Y D-I-C-K-A-S-O-N. And I'm a
19 student at Dickinson College in Carlisle,
20 Pennsylvania, originally from Massachusetts. Thank
21 you for the opportunity to speak today and show my
22 support for Pennsylvania joining the Regional
23 Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

24 Coming to Pennsylvania for college has
25 been extremely rewarding, as I've been lucky enough

1 to learn more about the state and meet so many new
2 people. I love the beautiful trails I've discovered
3 near my college that I get to hike and run along and
4 I love jogging through the Cumberland Valley when
5 the leaves start to turn. I even got the chance to
6 run a half marathon through Philly last fall.

7 One thing that I've learned is the
8 drastically different ways environmental issues are
9 addressed state to state and how Pennsylvania seems
10 to be behind some other states in terms of
11 environmental progress. Massachusetts is definitely
12 not leading the way in addressing the climate crisis
13 but they are ahead of Pennsylvania in that they've
14 already enacted several policies that are moving us
15 in the right direction toward tackling climate
16 change such as being a part of RGGI.

17 One of the most pivotal times I
18 realized how lucky I was to live in a state that has
19 rules in place to protect the health of our air was
20 this fall. One of my close friends has pretty
21 severe asthma. And she attends school out in
22 California. This fall, when the wildfires were
23 really bad, she decided to accept the risk of air
24 travel during a pandemic to come home to
25 Massachusetts to get away from the smog and horrible

1 air.

2 The air in her hometown in California
3 was so bad, she wasn't able to walk outside without
4 needing her inhaler. So she quite literally came
5 home for a weekend to be able to breathe and give
6 her lungs a rest.

7 While this example falls outside of
8 Pennsylvania, I think it shows just how important
9 having clean air is. When it's unsafe to have your
10 windows open, you start to realize that air quality
11 is something that cannot be compromised.

12 I love living here in Pennsylvania so
13 much and I do not want to see this state become one
14 that people need to leave in order to give their
15 lungs a break from polluted air. When I'm able to
16 come back to Carlisle, I want to be able to keep
17 running and hiking outside without compromising my
18 health. And we have a chance to ensure that our air
19 stays clean and breathable for all Pennsylvania
20 residents.

21 RGGI will have positive impacts on
22 climate change as well as health benefits.
23 Pennsylvania is the fourth largest emitter of
24 greenhouse gases in the country. We need to take
25 serious action to reduce our footprint and RGGI is a

1 crucial step.

2 RGGI states have had a 40 percent
3 decrease in fossil fuel emissions since 2008 and if
4 Pennsylvania joined, by 2030, it would reduce fossil
5 fuel amounts to taking 36 million cars off the road.
6 While Pennsylvania has not had horrible wildfires,
7 we do have serious air quality issues because of our
8 addiction to fossil fuels.

9 The facts are clear. Cleaner air
10 means less respiratory-related health issues and
11 joining RGGI could prevent up to 30,000 hospital
12 visits and reduce the amounts of sulfur dioxide,
13 nitrogen dioxide and particulate matter in the air.
14 These substances are linked to respiratory illness,
15 heart attack, stroke and mental health problems.

16 The air we breathe needs to be clean
17 in order to protect those most vulnerable to air
18 pollution complications such as children, elderly
19 people and those living in low income communities.
20 In order to avoid becoming a place where people need
21 to leave in order to be able to breathe,
22 Pennsylvania needs to join RGGI, a program that
23 would help the state improve air quality and protect
24 its residents from future breathing issues.

25 If the pandemic has taught us anything

1 positive, it's that outside spaces are so valuable
2 and being able to get outside can be a huge
3 privilege. If we cannot safely go outside in
4 Pennsylvania without compromising our health, then
5 we are being denied the rights to clean air and
6 water that our constitution promises us.

7 I am urging Pennsylvania to finally
8 begin to take serious action to protect our air and
9 join RGGI. You have the power to prevent us from
10 ending up like California was this fall, a state
11 that its residents needed to leave in order to be
12 able to breathe clean air.

13 Thank you.

14 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Lily.

15 Next, we have number nine, Alex
16 Charlton.

17 MR. CHARLTON: Good evening.

18 My name is Alex Charlton and I live in
19 Springfield, Pennsylvania. Last name is
20 C-H-A-R-L-T-O-N.

21 Now I'd like to express my strong
22 support for Pennsylvania's participation in the
23 regional greenhouse gas initiative. RGGI is a well-
24 established and proven program that will provide
25 Pennsylvania with both economic and environmental

1 benefits that will extend well into the future.

2 As a former legislator of the
3 Pennsylvania House, I understand that the decisions
4 have consequences and benefits must be balanced
5 against the negatives. Often times initiatives that
6 are good for the economy come with a detriment to
7 the environment and vice versa. RGGI is a unique
8 exception that provides substantial benefits to
9 both.

10 By implementing the cap-and-invest
11 program like RGGI, Pennsylvania will have the
12 opportunity to clean up our environment while
13 simultaneously providing growth and job
14 opportunities across the Commonwealth. RGGI
15 represents a beat in the business that makes
16 Pennsylvania an attractive location for opportunity
17 and growth.

18 Not only will joining RGGI help
19 prevent job losses in nuclear, solar, wind and
20 hydropower industries as well as numerous service
21 and technical industries that support these critical
22 industries, but it will also attract new investment
23 in clean energy projects.

24 Pennsylvania joining RGGI has found
25 support from a large diversity of businesses with

1 strong ties to Pennsylvania including BP America,
2 Shell, Exelon, Nestle, Mars Incorporated, and
3 National Foundry of Products among many others.

4 While Pennsylvania's net economic
5 gains are projected to be between \$1.3 and \$2.8
6 billion between 2022 and 2030, the most dramatic
7 benefit is in our health outcomes from reduced air
8 pollution. Recently, Dr. Wei Peng at Penn State
9 University presented her research in RGGI's
10 projected impact on air quality and health outcomes.
11 As a result of using more precise modeling of SO2
12 and NOx emissions, Dr. Peng's research realized a
13 substantially higher cost benefit evaluation as
14 compared to DEPs health co-benefits estimates.

15 When the DEP projected that
16 Pennsylvania would realize a \$2.82 billion savings
17 in cumulative health benefits, Dr. Peng's research
18 projects a substantially larger, \$12 to \$35 billion
19 savings in cumulative health co-benefits by 2030.

20 But Pennsylvania's participation in
21 RGGI is not just a benefit within our borders, even
22 when accounting for leakage, the entire PGM market
23 would realize a \$0.6 billion benefit in new economic
24 growth and additional --- and an additional \$10 to
25 \$22 billion in health co-benefits.

1 Globally, Pennsylvania joining RGGI
2 would potentially produce \$1.9 billion in climate
3 benefits. These are numbers that simply cannot be
4 ignored. RGGI represents a future in carbon-free
5 energy production that protects jobs in the nuclear,
6 solar, wind, and hydropower industries and
7 encourages growth and innovation, while
8 simultaneously providing dramatic benefits to our
9 air quality and health of our communities.

10 I am very excited to see what the
11 future will bring us with Pennsylvania's
12 participation in RGGI.

13 Thank you very much for your time.

14 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Alex.

15 Next up, we have number ten, Kyle
16 Rivers.

17 MR. RIVERS: Can you guys hear me?

18 MS. SHIRLEY: Yeah, we can hear you.

19 MR. RIVERS: Okay. Great.

20 Good evening, Mr. Chairman and members
21 of this board. My name is Kyle Rivers and I am CASA
22 Pennsylvania's Advocacy Specialist.

23 CASA is the largest membership-based
24 immigrant rights organization in Pennsylvania with
25 over 2,000 members in six Pennsylvania counties.

1 Thank you for allowing me to testify in support of
2 the implementation of the Regional Greenhouse Gas
3 Initiative.

4 At the beginning of every legislative
5 session, CASA members come together, this year
6 virtually, to discuss the issues that are most
7 important to them. Climate justice has consistently
8 been at the top of that list for the previous three
9 years. Our members understand the threat that
10 climate change poses to their families and their
11 community. Often, they are the ones that feel the
12 impacts of climate change and climate injustice
13 before anybody else.

14 That is precisely why our members have
15 been so active throughout the course of these
16 hearings in order to voice their support in the
17 implementation of RGGI by the EQB and DEP and why
18 I'm happy to testify in support of RGGI on behalf of
19 CASA members.

20 Undoubtedly, climate change is the
21 greatest threat that people not just here in the
22 Commonwealth but globally face. That is why it is
23 imperative that RGGI be adopted and implemented so
24 that all Pennsylvanians are able to live in a
25 healthy and safe environment.

1 It has been proven that people of
2 color are disproportionately affected by climate
3 change. Many of the natural gas burning power
4 generation facilities that will be impacted by RGGI
5 are located in these communities. These facilities
6 are responsible for releasing large amounts of
7 fossil fuels and other harmful toxins into the
8 atmosphere in these communities yielding higher
9 asthma and other respiratory diseases including
10 Covid-19.

11 Our members have been impacted firsthand
12 not just by climate change, as we saw with the
13 thousands of Puerto Ricans that fled their native
14 homeland as a result of Hurricane Maria, but also by
15 climate injustice and are fighting to raise their
16 families in a community that will not negatively
17 impact their health and their family's health.

18 The Commonwealth of Pennsylvania is
19 constitutionally obligated to preserve natural
20 resources for all citizens of PA which is not
21 limited to the air that they breathe or the water
22 that they drink. RGGI would definitively be holding
23 up the Commonwealth's end of that bargain.

24 Additionally, RGGI would be a first
25 step in remedying years of historical racial

1 injustices to people of color and their communities.
2 Of the estimated \$300 million in revenue generated
3 by RGGI, the Commonwealth would be given the
4 opportunity and should invest in historically
5 underrepresented communities through the creation of
6 green spaces, investing in green good paying jobs in
7 these communities as well as investing in public
8 infrastructure such as schools.

9 With the Commonwealth being the third
10 highest emitter of greenhouse gases in the country
11 and the first largest corporate producer of natural
12 gas, it is time that our state government works to
13 protect it's citizens, not the large corporations
14 who have continued to inflict irreparable harm on
15 communities statewide.

16 Instead of putting money back into the
17 pockets of large energy corporations, the money
18 generated by RGGI should be put back into the
19 communities that keep Pennsylvania running. Between
20 now and 2030, Pennsylvania has the opportunity to
21 create over 27,000 jobs and boost the state economy
22 by almost \$2 billion. The data clearly shows that
23 RGGI is good for the economy. When the economy
24 thrives, so do the people.

25 Many of CASA's members relocated to

1 the United States for a better life for themselves
2 and their families. The implementation of RGGI
3 would be creating an economy here in Pennsylvania
4 that would make that possible. For all the reasons
5 stated above, CASA is in strong support of the
6 implementation of RGGI and urges the EQB and DEP to
7 make Pennsylvania a part of RGGI.

8 Thank you.

9 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Kyle.

10 Next, we have number 11, Kristen
11 Nichols.

12 MS. NICHOLS: Hi.

13 MS. SHIRLEY: Hi Kristen.

14 MS. NICHOLS: Good evening and thank
15 you for the opportunity to testify tonight in favor
16 of DEP's proposed RGGI rule.

17 My name is Kristen Nichols
18 K-R-I-S-T-E-N N-I-C-H-O-L-S and I live in
19 Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. I have a Bachelor's of
20 Arts in environmental studies and a minor in
21 economics from the University of Pittsburgh and I am
22 currently pursuing a Juris Doctorate at Temple
23 University Beasley School of Law.

24 I have worked at various national and
25 international environmental organizations including

1 the Group Against Smog and Pollution in Pittsburgh,
2 British Water in London, and the Region Free Office
3 of the US Environmental Protection Agency.

4 Pennsylvanians overwhelmingly support
5 joining RGGI. Seventy-nine (79) percent of
6 Pennsylvanians support placing a limit on carbon
7 pollution from power plants and more than seven in
8 ten Pennsylvania voters support the state's
9 participation in RGGI. I agree.

10 The most important thing I want to
11 emphasize to the board tonight is that joining RGGI
12 and transitioning our power plants to cleaner energy
13 sources is not a sacrifice, but a massive
14 opportunity. Pennsylvania's economy is undergoing a
15 fundamental transition away from unsustainable
16 energy sources to a clean energy economy that works
17 for everyone, including future generations of
18 Pennsylvanians yet to come.

19 I was born and raised in Philadelphia.
20 Both sides of my family have lived in Philadelphia
21 since they immigrated to America. I went to the
22 University of Pittsburgh for my undergraduate
23 education to study the intersection of environmental
24 policy and economics.

25 I understand the common values and

1 concerns of Pennsylvanians. I understand the air of
2 hesitancy some Pennsylvania citizens express when
3 faced with the transition from fossil fuels to clean
4 energy. But the root of their hesitation is a
5 longing for economic security and stability which is
6 exactly what RGGI can offer the Commonwealth's
7 citizens.

8 The fastest growing job in America
9 today is wind turbine technicians. The third
10 fastest growing job is solar installer. Today in
11 Pennsylvania, at 90 thousand and counting, clean
12 energy jobs already outnumber fossil fuel jobs.
13 DEP's own analysis shows RGGI will add another
14 27,000 clean energy jobs to that figure and inject
15 nearly \$2 million into the state's economy.

16 RGGI has been a big success to the
17 seven states where it's already in place, cutting
18 climate pollution by a third and raising nearly \$3
19 billion dollars to invest in energy efficiency and
20 clean energy projects.

21 Carbon emissions from power plants in
22 RGGI states have fallen by 47 percent, outpacing the
23 rest of the country by 90 percent. Not only is RGGI
24 good for Pennsylvania, it is arguably DEP's duty to
25 implement RGGI under section 27 of the Pennsylvania

1 Constitution.

2 Under the environmental rights
3 amendment, all levels of Pennsylvania government
4 have a duty to conserve and maintain the people's
5 right to clean air, pure water, and the preservation
6 of the natural, scenic, and historic values of the
7 environment which are the common property of all
8 Pennsylvanians including generations yet to come.

9 This means DEP has a constitutional
10 duty to reduce the carbon emissions that are
11 unleashing global climate chaos. Additionally, it
12 will soon be required by federal regulation. Once
13 President-elect Biden takes the oath of office on
14 January 20th, one of the top items on his to do list
15 will be directing his new EPA administrator to
16 exercise their authority under the federal clean air
17 act to require states to reduce greenhouse gas
18 emissions.

19 RGGI will be a key --- will be key to
20 Pennsylvania's ability to comply with that federal
21 duty. I strongly support joining RGGI along with
22 the majority of Pennsylvanians and I urge DEP to
23 pass the necessary regulations to implement RGGI in
24 our Commonwealth. I support setting a stringent cap
25 and aggressive reduction targets that will ensure

1 Pennsylvania becomes a leader amongst other
2 Northeast states in reducing greenhouse gas
3 emissions.

4 RGGI is a giant step in the right
5 direction in preparing Pennsylvania for a change in
6 climate and transitioning our economy to a cleaner
7 energy future.

8 Thank you.

9 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Kristen.

10 Next, we have number 12, Ella
11 Henderson.

12 Do we have Ella?

13 MS. HENDERSON: Yes, sorry.

14 Hi. My name is Ella Henderson. It's
15 spelled E-L-L-A H-E-N-D-E-R-S-O-N. I live in
16 Johnstown, Pennsylvania and I'm very grateful for
17 the chance to speak.

18 I'm a 17-year-old high school senior
19 and climate change is an issue that is incredibly
20 important to me and is literally determining my
21 future. If we don't do something now, this planet
22 will be uninhabitable within my lifetime and this
23 will affect my plans greatly. So I feel like I'm
24 speaking on behalf of a generation where this issue
25 is determining our futures in unexpected kinds of

1 ways and I can't even begin to describe the urgency
2 and existential consequences if we don't do
3 something now.

4 As the fourth largest emitter of
5 greenhouse gases, Pennsylvania has a responsibility
6 in reducing emissions. We have an opportunity to do
7 something in collaboration with other RGGI states by
8 joining the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

9 By joining, carbon emissions in
10 Pennsylvania could be reduced by 188 million tons by
11 2030 which is the equivalent of taking more than 36
12 million cars off the road. In fact, carbon emission
13 has decreased by 47 percent in participating states,
14 outpacing the rest of the country by 90 percent.
15 The data is undisputable.

16 RGGI is a practical step in the right
17 direction in the fight against climate change. And
18 besides that, renewable energy is practical and
19 pervasive. I thought that this country was built by
20 innovation and progress. So why are we still using
21 and subsidizing fossil fuels that are expensive and
22 dirty when you can use numerous others for a green
23 economy?

24 In a region where we don't use coal
25 anymore and revert to cars, we would need other

1 technologies so that we could take steps to further
2 technology to have a cleaner future and again,
3 create a greener economy.

4 RGGI has proven to be beneficial to
5 individuals and their economy overall. Several
6 sections from RGGI will greatly benefit individuals
7 and especially those who are most affected by poor
8 air quality, specifically seniors, children and
9 those living in low income areas.

10 It will also reduce emissions of
11 sulfur dioxide an estimated 112,000 tons, nitrogen
12 oxide by an estimated 67,000 tons and particulate
13 matter which causes respiratory illnesses, heart
14 attack, stroke, cancers and mental health issues.

15 We can expect premature deaths which
16 as well as respiratory illnesses could be prevented
17 as well as 30,000 hospital visits could be avoided.

18 It will also help individuals because the
19 introduction of RGGI by the states will lower their
20 electricity prices by 5.7 percent. That would place
21 Pennsylvania electricity, on the low end, of 8.6
22 percent.

23 RGGI is projected to create 27,000 new
24 jobs in Pennsylvania and bring in nearly \$2 billion
25 into Pennsylvania's economy in the next decade

1 alone. We also see the economic growth in RGGI
2 states has outpaced the rest of the country by 35
3 percent.

4 If you feel that individuals in
5 Pennsylvania deserve a green economy and if you want
6 more benefits and the best for the next generation,
7 I'm begging you to please join the Regional
8 Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

9 I yield the remainder of my time.

10 Thank you.

11 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Ella.

12 Next, we have number 13, Margherita
13 Abe.

14 MS. ABE: Can you hear me?

15 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes, we can hear you.

16 MS. ABE: Excellent. Thank you for
17 permitting me to have this opportunity to testify.

18 My name is Margherita Abe. The
19 spelling is M-A-R-G-H-E-R-I-T-A, last name Abe is
20 spelled A-B-E. I'm a retired anesthesiologist who
21 lives in Philadelphia.

22 I strongly support the proposed rule
23 on Pennsylvania linking to the Regional Greenhouse
24 Gas Initiative. For much of the past two decades,
25 I've observed with growing concern and alarm the

1 neglect that our country and state have accorded
2 climate change.

3 The reason for my dismay of the
4 situation is its capacity to inflict permanent
5 damage on our citizens, especially our children and
6 grandchildren into the future. With increasing
7 carbon dioxide methane being spewed into the
8 atmosphere, we face increasing temperatures that
9 will impact on our lives in multiple ways.

10 Philadelphia is one city that is
11 expected to be severely impacted by hotter summer
12 temperatures. It is the largest poor city in the
13 country and a large part of the population lacks air
14 conditioning in their homes.

15 In addition, throughout the state,
16 increased levels of carbon dioxide and other
17 pollutants produced by the fossil fuel industry
18 negatively impact human health. This leads to an
19 increased morbidity and mortality from heart and
20 lung diseases as well as from increased incidents of
21 cancers. Poorer neighbors are impacted more than
22 more affluent ones in Philadelphia and elsewhere in
23 the state.

24 Pennsylvania ranks as the fourth top
25 emitter after California, Texas, and Florida of

1 fossil fuel related pollutants. If Philadelphia ---
2 if Pennsylvania joins RGGI and works to reduce its
3 emissions, then this will have an outsized impact on
4 the United States' level of these pollutants.

5 What Pennsylvania will receive in
6 return for this action is an increased number of
7 jobs related to the renewable energy industry and
8 decreased energy sources, of course, for consumers
9 and a healthier environment for its citizens.

10 Joining RGGI is the right decision for
11 Pennsylvanians.

12 Thank you for this opportunity to
13 speak.

14 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Margherita.

15 Next, we have number 14, Dan Smith.

16 MR. SMITH: Hey, there. Can y'all
17 hear me all right?

18 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

19 MR. SMITH: Excellent.

20 My name is Dan Smith. That is spelled
21 D-A-N S-M-I-T-H. I am from Washington, D.C. and I
22 am testifying on behalf of Nuclear Matters this
23 evening. Thank you for the opportunity.

24 Pennsylvania and its clean energy
25 future are at a critical junction. By joining the

1 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, Pennsylvania's
2 leaders are seizing the opportunity to build a more
3 resilient, sustainable economy while taking a
4 significant step towards achieving the state's
5 ambitious carbon reduction goals.

6 There is no doubt that Pennsylvania
7 needs smart, economically viable solutions to
8 protect its environment, air quality and public
9 health. Experts say we have just over a decade to
10 stop irreversible damage from climate change. And
11 the most efficient way to tackle these issues is by
12 increasing our generation of carbon free energy
13 which means sources like nuclear power must continue
14 to be a key component of the state's clean energy
15 solutions.

16 I represent Nuclear Matters, a
17 national coalition of more than 600,000 advocates
18 that works to inform the public and policy makers
19 about the clear benefits of nuclear energy. Our
20 coalition supports proven and clean energy solutions
21 like RGGI, which properly values nuclear power as a
22 reliable, affordable, safe, and carbon-free
23 electricity resource that's essential to America's
24 energy in the future.

25 We applaud Pennsylvania and state

1 leaders like Governor Tom Wolf for taking steps and
2 to the Commonwealth and to RGGI, and we encourage
3 them to continue doing everything in their power to
4 fight climate change and support carbon-free nuclear
5 energy alongside other clean energy technologies and
6 solutions.

7 By pledging to reduce carbon dioxide
8 emissions, Pennsylvania is asserting itself as a
9 leader in clean power generation bolstered by its
10 commitment to nuclear power and a growing share of
11 renewable energy sources. By joining RGGI,
12 Pennsylvania leaders are also taking a big step
13 towards protecting the state's four remaining
14 nuclear power plants; Beaver Valley, Limerick, Peach
15 Bottom, and Susquehanna which provide 92 percent of
16 the state's clean electricity generation, saving our
17 atmosphere from more than 51 million metric tons of
18 carbon dioxide emissions each year.

19 Currently, nuclear energy is one of
20 Pennsylvania's primary tools for reducing carbon
21 emissions and RGGI, along with other necessary
22 actions, will ensure the nation's largest source of
23 carbon-free energy is here to stay on the
24 Commonwealth.

25 As you know, RGGI uses flexible

1 market-based approaches to cutting power plant
2 pollution through a cap-and-invest program. Because
3 of its well-documented success, the initiative has
4 become a model for states like Pennsylvania that
5 want to transition to cleaner energy while reaping
6 billions of dollars in economic, health and social
7 benefits.

8 Since its launch, RGGI states have cut
9 their carbon pollution from power plants by more
10 than half, putting the region at the forefront of
11 the battle against climate change. Pennsylvania's
12 participation in RGGI is projected to reduce its
13 emissions by a massive 188 million tons by 2030.
14 The prevalence of a myriad of dangerous pollutants
15 such as sulfur dioxide and nitrogen oxides which are
16 linked to human health impacts including
17 developmental delays, heart attacks, respiratory
18 diseases, and even cancer will also drop
19 significantly.

20 In total, these emission reductions
21 will produce up to \$525 million in health benefits
22 per year, a remarkable advancement for the well-
23 being of Pennsylvanians. Joining RGGI wouldn't just
24 benefit Pennsylvania's environment and public
25 health, it would also boost the state's economy.

1 Since implementation, RGGI states have saved
2 consumers hundreds of millions of dollars on energy
3 and created thousands of family-sustaining clean
4 energy jobs.

5 Pennsylvania is well-positioned to
6 replicate these results. In fact, the DEP's model
7 estimates participating in RGGI would lead to a net
8 increase of over 27,000 jobs in Pennsylvania and an
9 increase of nearly \$2 billion in gross state
10 product. This would be in addition to the 15,000
11 family-sustaining jobs that Pennsylvania's four
12 nuclear power plants currently support.

13 Clearly, the clean power sector is an
14 invaluable engine of sustainable job creation,
15 capable of putting thousands of Pennsylvanians to
16 work while ensuring a healthier environment for all.
17 As our country seeks to recover from the Coronavirus
18 pandemic, we must enact policies that will put
19 Pennsylvanians to work to protect against future
20 health disasters.

21 RGGI has a proven track record of
22 lowering carbon dioxide emissions and boosting
23 economies. And its implementation will help ensure
24 that we're not caught flat-footed again.

25 By joining RGGI, Pennsylvania will

1 help lead our country's charge against climate
2 change and ensure Pennsylvanians can enjoy the
3 benefits of nuclear carbon-free energy and
4 renewables for decades to come.

5 On behalf of Nuclear Matters' 600,000
6 advocates, I strongly support and applaud the
7 Environmental Quality Board's proposal to confirm
8 Pennsylvania's participation in RGGI. Pennsylvania's
9 clean energy future looks bright because of this
10 commitment. And we look forward to the swift
11 enactment of the RGGI program.

12 I yield the rest of my time.

13 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Dan.

14 Next, we have number 15, Kaitlyn
15 Wagner. Do we have Kaitlyn on?

16 MS. WAGNER: Can you hear me?

17 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes, we can hear you.

18 MS. WAGNER: Okay perfect. Yes. All
19 right.

20 Kaitlyn is spelled K-A-I-T-L-Y-N and
21 Wagner is W-A-G-N-E-R. I'm a resident of Pottstown,
22 PA. I'm presenting on behalf of myself and
23 appreciate the time I have received today. I will
24 keep this short as numerous statistics have
25 graciously already been presented.

1 So some background on myself. I
2 received a Bachelor of Science degree from Ohio
3 State in Environmental Science focusing on water
4 quality. But while there, I found air quality in
5 parallel.

6 I went on to work for Exelon
7 Generation because I care about both our rights to
8 clean air and clean water. I then continued to
9 receive a Master's Degree from Vermont Law School
10 focusing on environmental and energy law with a
11 minor in climate change law.

12 Since setting up my career, now I am
13 an environmental engineer and one of my many
14 environmental compliance programs I handle is the PA
15 DEP air permits for nuclear power plants. Since
16 these two emission calculations are part of these
17 permits, I know firsthand how zero carbon nuclear
18 energy is and numerous other emissions.

19 I also used to work at Three Mile
20 Island, a nuclear power plant near Harrisburg that
21 was shut down last September. Luckily, I personally
22 did not have a major impact as I am young in my
23 career but many families were impacted by the
24 closure of this nuclear power plant. So I believe
25 and also --- I believe I also understand and I am

1 extremely humbled by the market-based aspect of the
2 energy sector.

3 So the Regional Greenhouse Gas
4 Initiative is a market-based approach and will
5 ensure a competitive environment for innovative
6 clean technology. It will allow sustainable
7 generations' storage and infrastructure to develop
8 itself. Small modules in advanced nuclear reactive
9 technologies are on the horizon and I believe in
10 Pennsylvania and their want to be sustainably
11 innovative.

12 Outside of the technology innovation,
13 it is about our people and their right to clean air.
14 RGGI imposes the intrinsic value of air quality.
15 Pennsylvania has 286 people per square mile.
16 Pennsylvania's population density ranks 11th in the
17 nation after New Jersey, Rhode Island,
18 Massachusetts, Connecticut, Maryland, Delaware, and
19 New York; all states part of RGGI already.

20 All 12.8 million Pennsylvania
21 residents have a right to clean air. Also all
22 members of RGGI also have that right as air quality
23 knows no state line. Therefore, until there is a
24 bipartisan agreement within the federal government,
25 it is Pennsylvania's duty to enter RGGI.

1 On a personal level, I am in my 20s.
2 And beginning in 2021, I will be going to school to
3 receive a license from the nuclear regulatory
4 committee to operate nuclear power plants ---
5 nuclear power plant as a senior reactor operator. I
6 believe in nuclear technology as a part of the
7 future and RGGI will make this possible.

8 As I invest in my future and career in
9 clean energy generation, Pennsylvania must also do
10 their part in investing RGGI. Please, please an
11 exclamation point after that last statement.

12 I yield the rest of my time.

13 Thank you.

14 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Kaitlyn.

15 Next, we have number 16, Juan Llarena.

16 MR. LLARENA: Thank you very much.

17 My name is Juan Llarena, J-U-A-N
18 L-L-A-R-E-N-A from Erie, Pennsylvania. Thank you
19 for holding these public comments. I'm grateful to
20 participate in support of Pennsylvania joining RGGI.

21 I grew up in Miami, Florida. And as a
22 student, I strived to do my best. My education gave
23 me an appreciation for civic engagement, history,
24 literature, and the sciences. So with a good
25 education, I joined the Navy and traveled the world.

1
2 I returned to Miami, married and
3 raised a family. We lived near Biscayne Bay and I
4 witnessed for the next 25 years the rising sea
5 levels, damage to coral reefs, and an increase of
6 harmful algae blooms that scientists kept reporting
7 about.

8 I also witnessed stronger and more
9 frequent hurricanes than I had as a boy growing up.
10 So when I retired, my wife and I investigated the
11 best places to live in climate change. So now we
12 live in Erie, Pennsylvania as an early wave of
13 climate migration. I have also encouraged my
14 children to set roots in places where science
15 predicts it is best to live with climate change.

16 So why do I support Pennsylvania
17 joining RGGI? Because the states that currently
18 participate in RGGI are witnesses to its benefits.
19 And all those benefits have already been said by
20 participants.

21 So I yield my time. Thank you for
22 listening. And let's all join together for a
23 cleaner Pennsylvania.

24 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Juan.

25 Next, we have number 17, Brandon

1 Hoover.

2 MR. HOOVER: Hi. Can you hear me?

3 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

4 MR. HOOVER: Wonderful. Thank you so
5 much for your --- the time to speak on the subject
6 of Pennsylvania's participation in the Regional
7 Greenhouse Gas Initiative with other mid-Atlantic
8 states.

9 I was thrilled to see Pennsylvania
10 consider joining our peers across the mid-Atlantic
11 to mitigate the worst impacts of climate change.
12 I've spent the majority of my career in
13 Pennsylvania's colleges and universities working to
14 reduce energy consumption, increase stable practices
15 and generally reduce the impact of climate change.
16 As the fourth largest state for higher education,
17 our universities have been leading the charge for
18 climate mitigation.

19 However, as an educator, I also listen
20 to students who are expressing deep concern,
21 frustration, fear, and worry. Students see the
22 scientific evidence and the hesitancy of their
23 immediate ancestors to act on it. These students
24 across the political spectrum shake their heads in
25 disgust when they learn that the climate scientific

1 community has been sounding a terrifying alarm about
2 excess carbon dioxide since before the 1980s, but
3 we've waited this long to do anything about it.

4 For most of my career, people ask me
5 in despair what personal actions could possibly
6 limit something as large as climate change. I used
7 to list out all the individual actions people can
8 take. But I recently came to realize people ask
9 these questions not because they are unsure of the
10 solutions. We're very aware of those.

11 The real reason people ask this
12 question is because they feel hopeless that their
13 actions will make any difference. We're hopeless
14 because we've been too focused on the individual
15 instead of the commonwealth of our community. By
16 questioning our ability to solve climate change, we
17 forget that our actions collectively degraded the
18 atmosphere to begin with.

19 And it is our collective actions that
20 can reverse these impacts. While there are so many
21 things I and my students are concerned about, I am
22 seeing and feeling hope spring up as we remember
23 stories about collective action.

24 During World War II, when the fear of
25 German aggression on American shores as at it's

1 height, households and businesses in cities on both
2 coasts turned off their lights and closed their
3 shops early to limit visible targets. At the height
4 of the space race in the '60s, Americans rallied
5 with public support as engineers, mathematicians,
6 policy makers, and educators all partnered to land a
7 person on the moon.

8 Now, in the midst of a global
9 pandemic, there are more stories of people
10 collectively wearing masks and partnering on vaccine
11 development. In times of great crisis and
12 opportunity, we lean on great collective action and
13 hope. That is the best of who we are. I see RGGI
14 as a step toward hope. It will require immense
15 collective action in the form of policy to stave off
16 the worse of climate change. And RGGI is voiced to
17 reduce carbon dioxide in Pennsylvania by 188 million
18 tons by 2030.

19 It can help clean up the air in our
20 historically disenfranchised environmental justice
21 communities such as Chester, Norristown,
22 Philadelphia, and Harrisburg. RGGI is also proven
23 policy that works.

24 Not only that, but Pennsylvania's
25 participation in RGGI isn't guesswork policy. It

1 makes sense and the vast majority of residents want
2 to see this policy enacted.

3 In closing, I ask that our policy
4 makers take a step toward hope. Most of us agree
5 with each other about the solutions to climate
6 change more than we may think. But to enact these
7 solutions, we must collectively act and step towards
8 that hope. Known that by doing something together,
9 we are becoming architects of a cleaner world we
10 want to live in.

11 Thank you for the time.

12 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Brandon.

13 Next, we have number 18, Geoffrey
14 Selling.

15 MR. SELLING: Can you hear me?

16 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

17 MR. SELLING: My name is Geoffrey
18 Selling, G-E-O-F-F-R-E-Y, Selling, S-E-L-L-I-N-G,
19 and I'm a resident of Philadelphia County.

20 Thank you to DEP for providing this
21 opportunity for citizens, businesses, and
22 organizations to testify in support of the CO2
23 budget trading program proposal.

24 Again, my name is Geoffrey Selling.
25 I'm a retired science teacher, a Pennsylvania master

1 watershed steward, although I'm not wearing that hat
2 tonight, and a weekly volunteer at Curtis Arboretum,
3 assisting with the preservation and maintenance of
4 the repairing of buffer on rock creek there.

5 I am a resident of Philadelphia though
6 most of my volunteer work takes me --- takes place
7 in Montgomery County.

8 Reacting to the recently released
9 scientific evidence that this year will be the
10 hottest on record as marine heat waves swelled over
11 80 percent of the world's oceans and triple digit
12 heat invaded Siberia, one of the planet's coldest
13 places, Secretary General of the United Nations,
14 Antonio Gutierrez recently said, as reported on the
15 front page of the Philadelphia Inquirer, quote, to
16 put it simply the state of the planet is broken.
17 Humanity is waging a war on nature. This is
18 suicidal. Nature always strikes back and it is
19 already doing so with growing force and fury,
20 unquote.

21 Here in Pennsylvania, our watersheds
22 are feeling that force and fury. As someone who now
23 works regularly within those aquatic ecosystems, I
24 wish to share some of the impacts that I have seen
25 and studied.

1 We are experiencing unprecedented
2 numbers of high intensity storms which our storm
3 water management systems are unprepared to handle.
4 As a result, flooding events are now regular
5 occurrences rather than rare instances. The
6 flooding damages homes, roads, and infrastructure
7 like bridges.

8 Trash, fertilizer, and road salt pour
9 into our streams damaging aquatic life because we
10 don't have systems to slow and dissipate those high
11 volumes of water. These high intensity runoff
12 events/storms also damage our streams directly by
13 eroding the banks, uprooting precious trees, and
14 washing tremendous quantities of soil, silt, and
15 sand into the streams.

16 Eventually, that silt blocks up
17 streams, buries the habitat of stream-dwelling
18 organisms, and deprives them of oxygen. And it
19 actually kills fish and aquatic insects that are the
20 basis of our all important aquatic food chain. The
21 muddy water absorbs more sunlight and this raises
22 stream temperatures, making streams uninhabitable
23 for creatures like our own state fish, the brook
24 trout.

25 I see this damage on a weekly basis in

1 Montgomery County, where I volunteer and where
2 almost every stream has been seriously impaired by
3 these excessive and powerful storm events, storms
4 that are directly correlated to rising global
5 temperatures.

6 We all know that water runs downhill
7 and also moves underground. Our reliance on fossil
8 fuels such as coal and natural gas has allowed all
9 kinds of toxic chemicals to leach underground or
10 flow directly into our already compromised streams.

11 Much of Pennsylvania lives downstream
12 from these mines and fracking sites and our aquatic
13 systems and consequent health have been damaged by
14 these pollutants. We need to move away from fossil
15 fuels. Our coal-fired power plants are aging and
16 most are at or beyond what is known as retirement
17 age.

18 Though natural gas may pollute a bit
19 less than coal itself, natural gas production and
20 use are still major causes of greenhouse gas
21 emissions that are damaging our air, water, and
22 climate.

23 For the sake of our children, our
24 grandchildren and beyond, not to mention our own
25 generation, we need to move away from fossil fuels

1 and towards a renewable and greener energy producing
2 system. The DEP has projected that we stand to gain
3 27,000 jobs, a \$2 billion increase to our gross
4 state product, and a \$3.7 billion in personal income
5 by taking such steps.

6 The regional greenhouse gas
7 initiative, RGGI, is not a perfect solution but it's
8 a major step that reorients our priorities and would
9 set us on a road to a cleaner, greener, and safer
10 environment and a more prosperous, sustainable state
11 economy.

12 I strongly urge the joining of the
13 RGGI Initiative.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Geoffrey.

16 Next, we have number 19, Wendy
17 Greenspan.

18 MS. GREENSPAN: Good evening.

19 Can you hear me?

20 MS. SHIRLEY: Good evening. Yes.

21 MS. GREENSPAN: My name is Wendy
22 Greenspan, W-E-N-D-Y G-R-E-E-N-S-P-A-N. I am a
23 citizen of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and a
24 resident of the city of Philadelphia.

25 I'm grateful for this opportunity to

1 testify before the Environmental Quality Board
2 regarding the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.
3 As you know, RGGI will bring many benefits to
4 Pennsylvania; a cleaner environment, a healthier
5 population, and a stronger economy.

6 Pennsylvania will also benefit from a
7 new revenue source. Through the RGGI auctions of
8 CO2 allowances, they've estimated that in 2022,
9 Pennsylvania will receive \$300 million in additional
10 revenue.

11 How should this money be invested? I
12 propose that a generous portion of it be targeted to
13 job development for two groups. Number one, the
14 environmental justice communities and number two,
15 workers in the fossil fuel industry. Environmental
16 justice or EJ communities are typically black,
17 brown, indigenous, or low income neighborhoods that
18 have disproportionately suffered the effects of
19 pollution. EJ communities have experienced high
20 levels of unemployment for generations and deserve
21 preferential consideration for jobs brought about by
22 the implementation of RGGI.

23 The job development should be directed
24 to a second group as well: workers in the fossil
25 fuel industries. While these workers have a history

1 of good-paying, secure jobs, they now face a future
2 of substantial unemployment as we transition to a
3 green economy. It is regarding the concerns of this
4 group, fossil fuel workers, that I will focus my
5 comments.

6 Unemployment is something my family
7 experienced firsthand. When our children were in
8 high school, my husband lost a good paying job at
9 AT&T due to industry-wide workforce reductions. It
10 was a very difficult time for us. We faced economic
11 and emotional challenges and it was several years
12 before we regained our footing.

13 Recently, I witnessed that same
14 anxiety in others in the aftermath of the PES oil
15 refinery explosion in 2019. I attended a public
16 hearing on the future of the refinery that included
17 many refinery workers and their spouses. I recall
18 speaking to one couple who told me that they had
19 young children at home and due concerns about their
20 future. I saw in their eyes the same fear and
21 uncertainty that my husband and I faced when we were
22 dealing with unemployment in our family.

23 And then about a month later, PES
24 announced the layoff of 1,000 workers without any
25 meaningful severance and without benefits, while

1 executives of the company received huge bonuses.
2 This was wrong, deeply wrong. And we cannot allow
3 that to happen to others if Pennsylvania transitions
4 from an extractive fossil fuel economy to a
5 renewable green economy.

6 RGGI will provide a new and much
7 needed revenue stream for Pennsylvania. With those
8 funds, we need to create a comprehensive and long-
9 term job transition program for workers from the
10 fossil fuel industry. Opportunities exist for
11 thousands of new jobs in renewable energy such as
12 wind and solar and in the energy efficiency sectors.

13 We need to ensure that those are
14 secure, unionized, long-term jobs with family-
15 sustaining wages, good benefits, and reliable
16 retirement pensions. Such a job transition program
17 will be a complex process and; therefore, planning
18 needs to start early to be ready for the changes
19 ahead.

20 I often wonder what happened to that
21 young couple I spoke with at the PES oil refinery
22 hearing. I'm certain that the layoffs were a
23 considerable hardship for them. Let's make sure
24 this doesn't happen to any other Pennsylvanians.
25 With funding from RGGI, let's create a strong,

1 comprehensive job transition program to move
2 valuable workers from the fossil fuel industry into
3 the new green economy.

4 Thank you.

5 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Wendy.

6 Next, we have number 20, Roger Clark.

7 MR. CLARK: Good evening.

8 My name is Roger Clark. My name is
9 Roger Clark, which is spelled correctly on the
10 witness list, and I live in Upper Dublin Township in
11 Montgomery County.

12 I recently retired from a 40 year
13 career working in Pennsylvania on clean energy. And
14 I am speaking as an individual.

15 There are three points that I want to
16 make in my testimony this evening. My first point
17 is the proposed CO2 budget trading program
18 regulation is a logical and important next step in
19 the arch of clean energy policy and law in
20 Pennsylvania. In 1960, Pennsylvania adopted the
21 Pennsylvania air pollution control act to protect
22 its citizens from air pollution.

23 In 1972, Pennsylvania adopted the
24 environmental rights amendment article 1 section 27
25 to the Pennsylvania Constitution. This amendment

1 recognizes the people's right to clean air, pure
2 water, and to the preservation of the natural,
3 scenic, historic and asthetic values of the
4 environment. And recent Commonwealth Appellate
5 Court decisions have given new meaning to this
6 amendment.

7 In 1980, Pennsylvania adopted the
8 Building Energy Conservation Act for a statewide
9 building energy code. In 1996, Pennsylvania passed
10 a Customer Choice in Electric Competition Act
11 allowing customers to shop for clean electricity.

12 In 2004, Pennsylvania adopted the
13 Alternative Energy Portfolio Standards Act requiring
14 renewable energy to be part of our electric
15 generation mix. Also in 2004, Pennsylvania adopted
16 the Guaranteed Energy Savings Act, providing state
17 and local governments the needed tools to finance
18 energy efficiency.

19 In 2012, Pennsylvania passed Act 129
20 legislation and directed Pennsylvania's electric
21 utilities to invest up to two percent of their
22 revenues to help customers conserve electricity.
23 And finally, in 2014, Pennsylvania passed the
24 Pennsylvania Greenhouse Gas Regulation
25 Implementation Act, throwing the federal government

1 in recognizing carbon as a pollutant.

2 None of these actions were perfect and
3 each is part of a long art of statutes, policies,
4 and programs that are moving Pennsylvania towards a
5 cleaner and more sustainable energy future. I see
6 the RGGI draft regulations as Pennsylvania's next
7 step in the quest for cleaner electricity, a healthy
8 environment, and a vibrant economy.

9 The second point I want to make is
10 that ever since the National Energy Act of 1978
11 deregulated wholesale natural gas prices, we have
12 seen energy prices become increasingly subject to
13 market forces and less determined by government
14 price regulation. But only when the environmental
15 consequences of our energy choices are included in
16 the price of energy when we internalize these
17 environmental externalities and the markets properly
18 decide between traditional fossil fuel sources and
19 the cleaner alternatives, including renewable energy
20 and energy conservation efficiency. This is what
21 RGGI does.

22 My third point this evening is that
23 Pennsylvania's failure to recognize the cost of
24 carbon pollution has caused our Commonwealth to lose
25 many clean energy projects and good jobs they would

1 have created. In my work at Reinvestment Fund, we
2 finance solar and other clean energy projects, most
3 of them located in neighboring states.

4 When I asked the developers why they
5 are doing so little business in Pennsylvania, they
6 tell me that our failure to recognize the cost of
7 carbon pollution means exciting new clean energy
8 projects we are losing out to our RGGI neighbors.

9 I strongly support the proposed CO2
10 budget trading program regulations and I thank the
11 Department for helping move Pennsylvania into a 21st
12 century energy world. As someone who has been in
13 the trenches for clean energy for 40 years, I
14 understand the opposition you are receiving from
15 polluting fossil fuel industries who worry their
16 time is drawing to a close.

17 Please know that you are doing the
18 right thing for the people of Pennsylvania. Our
19 environment and our economy will benefit from
20 participating in RGGI's mature regulatory program
21 and its market-based allowance auctions.

22 Thank you very much.

23 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Roger.

24 MR. CLARK: You're welcome.

25 MS. SHIRLEY: Next, number 21, C. Ben

1 Vila.

2 MR. VILA: Hello, everyone. Hi
3 everyone. My name is Ben Vila, B-E-N V-I-L-A. I
4 live in Philadelphia and I'm speaking today on
5 behalf of Temple's Environmental Law Society.

6 Thank you for the opportunity to
7 testify in favor of DEP's proposed RGGI rule.

8 Pennsylvanians know all too well that
9 climate change is real and that it's happening
10 already in our commonwealth. In Philadelphia County
11 alone, we've experienced record heat days, we had 36
12 tornado warnings last year and much of south
13 Philadelphia, including the Philadelphia
14 International Airport, is expected to be under water
15 within 30 years.

16 In part because of these grim
17 realities, Pennsylvanians overwhelmingly support
18 joining RGGI. Seventy-nine percent of
19 Pennsylvanians support placing a limit on carbon
20 pollution from power plants and more than seven in
21 ten Pennsylvania voters support the state's
22 participation in RGGI. I agree.

23 The most important thing that I want
24 to impart to the board today is that joining RGGI
25 and transitioning our power plants to cleaner energy

1 sources is not a sacrifice but instead a massive
2 opportunity. RGGI is one of the many tools that
3 Pennsylvania needs to put in place to open up
4 opportunities in sustainability and begin
5 transitioning Pennsylvania's economy into a clean
6 energy future.

7 My family lived in Pennsylvania for
8 generations. A child of Irish immigrants, my
9 grandmother moved from Pottsville to Philadelphia
10 during the Great Depression. Previously coalminers
11 and repair mechanics, my family sought new
12 opportunities in the factories that were making
13 Philadelphia up for manufacturing during World War
14 II.

15 My family moved to Philadelphia,
16 paralleled ships underway in Pennsylvania and much
17 of the rest of the country, as the economy moved
18 from coal and natural resource extraction in rural
19 areas to manufacturing and services in urban areas.

20 Similar to my grandma during the Great Depression,
21 I too am seeing a profound economic transition
22 underway today in Pennsylvania.

23 After graduating college, I lived in
24 Massachusetts, where I worked in the solar industry.
25 I worked for a wholesale equipment supplier that

1 distributed solar panels and other clean energy
2 technologies to local mom-and-pop solar installers
3 who were helping transition their neighbors to a
4 clean energy future, house by house and project by
5 project.

6 After a few years, I moved back home
7 to Pennsylvania where I wanted to use what I had
8 learned about the clean energy business and apply it
9 in our state to help transition my neighbors to
10 clean energy and help my communities prepare for
11 climate change.

12 I worked for two years in city
13 government here in Philadelphia, helping run solar
14 energy programs that encouraged homeowners to
15 install rooftop solar systems. This included
16 developing financing models to help make solar more
17 affordable for low and under-income households.

18 I'm now a student at Temple Law, and I
19 hope to use my legal education to one day help
20 businesses adapt to climate change and to invest in
21 a sustainable clean energy future here in
22 Pennsylvania.

23 Just like my grandmom experienced back
24 in the Great Depression, so too is Pennsylvania's
25 economy undergoing another fundamental transition.

1 Today's transition is moving away from unsustainable
2 energy sources to a clean energy economy that works
3 for everyone, including future generations of
4 Pennsylvanians yet to come.

5 Joining RGGI is a critically important
6 step our government can take to combat climate
7 change. RGGI has been a big success in the ten
8 states where it's already in place, cutting climate
9 pollution by a third and raising nearly \$3 billion
10 to invest in energy efficiency and clean energy
11 projects.

12 Carbon emissions from power plants in
13 RGGI states have fallen by 47 percent, outpacing the
14 rest of the country by 90 percent. According to
15 DEP's findings, joining RGGI will lead to a net
16 increase of more than 27,000 jobs and add \$1.9
17 billion to Pennsylvania's economy.

18 The fastest growing job today in
19 America is wind turbine technicians. The third
20 fastest growing job is solar installer. Today in
21 Pennsylvania, there are more clean energy jobs than
22 there are jobs in fossil fuels. I've seen these
23 trends firsthand, and I can see how these trends
24 will continue to make positive impacts on
25 Pennsylvania's economy and in Pennsylvania's

1 communities.

2 Not only is RGGI good for
3 Pennsylvania, it is within DEP's power and authority
4 to implement RGGI and the DEP arguably has a duty to
5 implement RGGI under Section 27 of the Pennsylvania
6 Constitution. Under the Environmental Rights
7 Amendment, all levels of Pennsylvania government
8 have a duty to conserve and maintain the people's
9 right to clean air, pure water, and the preservation
10 of natural, scenic, and historic values of the
11 environment are the common property of all
12 Pennsylvanians, including generations yet to come.

13 I strongly support joining RGGI along
14 with the majority of Pennsylvanians, and I urge the
15 DEP to pass the necessary regulations to implement
16 RGGI in our Commonwealth. I support setting a
17 stringent cap and aggressive reduction targets that
18 will ensure Pennsylvania becomes a leader and not a
19 lagger among other northeast states at reducing
20 emissions.

21 Just as my grandmother and myself have
22 been able to enjoy Pennsylvania's clean air and pure
23 water, joining RGGI will help ensure that future
24 Pennsylvanians will get to enjoy these things too.
25 RGGI is a giant step in the right direction.

1 Thank you.

2 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Ben.

3 Next, we have number 22, Laura
4 Murillo.

5 MS. MURILLO: Hi. It's Laura Murillo.

6 It's spelled M as in Mary U-R-I-L-L-O. I live in
7 Glenside, PA, which is a suburb of Philadelphia.
8 Thank you so much for allowing me the opportunity to
9 testify today. I'd like to provide my support of
10 the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, or RGGI.

11 This testimony is mostly personal.
12 Those before me graciously provided such wonderful
13 statistics. I have several personal reasons to
14 support this initiative.

15 Primary among them is that my oldest
16 son Sean has asthma. Naturally, this makes me
17 hyperaware of air quality in our area. And there's
18 no family history of asthma on either side of my
19 family or on the side of my husband, who is an
20 immigrant from Ecuador.

21 At the time of Sean's birth and early
22 development, we lived in Philadelphia. As you all
23 know, its home to several polluting industries,
24 particularly in Philadelphia, Energy Solutions
25 Refinery, which was mentioned earlier.

1 Given the lack of family history, I
2 can't think of anything other than poor air quality
3 as the direct contributing factor to my son's
4 asthma. I've witnessed how clearly the pure air
5 quality has caused flare ups, requiring his inhaler
6 or, worse, a trip to the ER.

7 Case in point, as we are learning, the
8 dramatic decrease in travel due to Covid-19
9 restrictions rather dramatically decreased carbon
10 emissions this year. 2020 is actually the first
11 year I can remember in many years ago where we
12 didn't have an emergency room visit. I can only
13 assume his improving asthma symptoms this year can
14 be attributed to that decrease.

15 I believe if we can adopt RGGI and
16 reduce emissions, my hope is that he can just be a
17 kid and enjoy a normal childhood without worrying if
18 he can breathe easily. Sorry, I get emotional
19 talking about my family.

20 But Pennsylvania is my home and my
21 roots. Everyone in my family was born and raised in
22 Pennsylvania since my great grandparents immigrated
23 here. Those on my father's side settled in
24 Johnstown. You probably know it as one of the power
25 houses during the Industrial Revolution. When he

1 wasn't serving in World War II, my grandfather
2 worked in the Johnstown Steel Mills with Cambria
3 Iron Works. His sons, my father and uncles, went to
4 work there as well.

5 All have suffered either heart or lung
6 issues such as red lung, heart disease, heart
7 attack, and stroke which killed both of my
8 grandparents. More recently, my father suffered a
9 stroke this year and is still recovering.

10 He had moved to Philadelphia decades
11 ago, worked for 25 years out of Frankford Terminal
12 for SEPTA, which exposed him to exhaust fumes in the
13 employee lounge. I actually remember as a child
14 living there, it smelled of exhaust.

15 According to the American Heart
16 Association, heart related diseases have been
17 directly related to air pollution. Thus, I believe
18 between inhaling the fine silt particulate in the
19 plants and the fumes from the terminal, that it
20 directly related to the conditions affecting my
21 family.

22 Now, we've been learning about
23 greenhouse effect and ozone since elementary school.
24 We know that carbon emissions damage our
25 environment. Initially, we called it global

1 warming. Now it's climate change. As our
2 terminology evolves, our understanding is deepened
3 thanks to scientific research.

4 Though the picture is getting clearer
5 and the conditions are more dire, not much has
6 changed in our relationship to fossil fuels.
7 Although I live paycheck to paycheck, I've made
8 sacrifices in other areas to purchase 100 percent
9 renewable energy for my home and buy organic. I've
10 contributed to environmental groups whenever I'm
11 able. Basically everything in my power with my
12 limited income.

13 If it were up to me, we would be here
14 talking about moving to net zero emissions. But, I
15 think RGGI is a wonderful first step. But, again,
16 the statistics are all in favor of RGGI. The funds
17 made available to the state can be used to
18 transition us off unstable fossil fuels and toward a
19 brighter future with sustainable renewable energy.

20 We truly have only to gain and nothing
21 to lose by participating in RGGI.

22 Thank you for listening.

23 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Laura.

24 Number 24 is unable to attend and will
25 be emailing their comments. So that brings us to

1 number 25, Desiree Carbone.

2 MS. CARBONE: Yes, can you hear me?

3 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

4 MS. CARBONE: Okay.

5 It's Desiree, D-E-S-I-R-E-E, Carbone,
6 C-A-R-B-O-N-E, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.

7 Good evening and thank you for letting
8 me participate in this very important hearing. My
9 name is Desiree Carbone and I am a recent resident
10 of Pittsburgh, moving here two and a half years ago
11 from Connecticut.

12 I live in the Region Square Area on a
13 very busy avenue next to the Interstate 376 entrance
14 and can hear the freight trains as they frequently
15 run by day and night.

16 Being in the middle of this high
17 volume traffic has sadly brought to my attention the
18 chronic air pollution Allegheny County and the State
19 of Pennsylvania are facing. It has been commonplace
20 for me to check the air quality on a daily basis and
21 constantly clean the soot that accumulates in my
22 apartment and the white vehicle I drive.

23 I have major concerns for all
24 residents of Pittsburgh when it comes to their
25 health and their well-being. All upper respiratory

1 illnesses in children and adults are associated with
2 a direct result and subject to poor air quality and
3 air pollution.

4 And let us not forget the Covid-19
5 pandemic and its long-term effects which is only
6 exasperating the respiratory health problems my
7 community was already facing.

8 During the month of November, we had
9 several days of alarming air quality and averaging
10 in the high moderate range. This unacceptable air
11 quality has caused me to develop inner ear fluid
12 that has lasted several weeks and still has not
13 completely cleared. I also had an inner ear illness
14 in late December 2019, which turned into a two month
15 recovery. This health hazard should not continue.

16 It is in the best interest for
17 Allegheny County for the Department of Environmental
18 Protection to support this model carbon rule being
19 proposed and Governor Wolf in his efforts from
20 Pennsylvania to join the Regional Greenhouse Gas
21 Initiative, known as RGGI, along with several other
22 surrounding states.

23 By joining RGGI, Pennsylvania can
24 lower air pollution while helping us raise millions
25 --- billions in revenue to invest in clean --- in

1 the clean energy initiative. This planet does not
2 belong to one person, one industry, one state, one
3 country, or one generation. We must take
4 responsibility for our actions and work together to
5 curb air pollution that has devastating effects on
6 our health, our environment, and our climate.

7 The time is now for our economy to
8 move forward into a healthy and thriving future by
9 supporting and encouraging clean and sustainable
10 energy alternatives. Giving innovation in these
11 areas the opportunity to excel and compete will help
12 our economy create jobs and lower our carbon
13 footprint.

14 Taking this bipartisan approach, we
15 can create a 2020 miracle, my favorite movie, to
16 guarantee the right to clean air, pure water, and to
17 the preservation of the natural, scenic, historic,
18 aesthetic values of our environment.

19 Let us all, once again, be able to
20 open up our windows on beautiful days without the
21 threat of illness.

22 Thank you for the opportunity to be
23 heard. I do hope I made a difference.

24 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Desiree.

25 Next, we have number 26, Russell

1 Golman.

2 MR. GOLMAN: Hi. Can you hear me?

3 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

4 MR. GOLMAN: Okay.

5 My name is Russell Golman. It's
6 spelled correctly on the schedule. And I live in
7 Pittsburgh. I'm speaking as a private citizen today
8 in support of participating in the Regional
9 Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

10 I am a professor of behavioral
11 economics and decision science at Carnegie Mellon
12 University. I do research on risk taking,
13 information search, and information avoidance,
14 behavioral game theory, and other aspects of
15 decision making in a variety of social and economic
16 situations. I teach strategic decision making and
17 decision analysis.

18 It strikes me that the decision to
19 participate in this initiative is exactly the kind
20 of decision I'd want my students to be able to
21 analyze. And really, you don't need to be a
22 professor of decision making to see that it's
23 obviously a good idea. This is intro level stuff.
24 The science is conclusive that burning fossil fuels
25 emits pollutants and contributes to climate change

1 and harms our health.

2 Global warming possesses --- global
3 warming poses serious systemic risks to our economy
4 and to our national security and is likely to have
5 disproportionately harmful impacts on the most
6 vulnerable populations. And even setting that
7 serious risk aside for a moment, high levels of
8 other air pollutants from carbon dioxide emitting
9 power plants lead to health issues like asthma,
10 COPD, and other respiratory diseases.

11 In ECON 101, you'd call emitting this
12 pollution a negative externality. In everyday life,
13 you might call it being a bad neighbor. There's a
14 straightforward solution here. Make power plants
15 internalize the costs that they have been imposing
16 on everyone else.

17 The Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative
18 does exactly that. Polluters have to purchase
19 allowances for their pollution in a regional auction
20 that efficiently sets their price. The amount of
21 carbon pollution is capped so we get less pollution
22 and better health. And the revenues generated from
23 the auction reduce the tax burden on all of us.

24 Power plants trying to reduce their
25 costs find alternative ways to generate electricity

1 that don't create so much pollution. For example
2 with wind and solar energy. As they invest in
3 renewable energy, they create thousands of high-
4 paying jobs and help clean up the air we breathe,
5 resulting in nearly \$5.7 billion in health benefits
6 and health care savings for members since 2008.
7 It's a win, win.

8 I have two young children. For the
9 most part, we love living in Pittsburgh. We hike in
10 Frick Park and Ohio Pyle, we swim at Sand Castle and
11 Raccoon Creek and the Clarion River. We enjoy the
12 outdoors, except when the air quality is so poor
13 that we can't.

14 I don't want my kids suffering from
15 asthma. I don't want anyone's kid suffering from
16 asthma or any of the harmful consequences of air
17 pollution or climate change.

18 Let's leave our kids a cleaner, safer
19 place to live.

20 Thank you.

21 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Russell.

22 Next, we have number 27, William
23 Sabey.

24 Do we have William?

25 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see him on the

1 line.

2 MS. SHIRLEY: Okay. William, if
3 you're out there and you're on, please get us a
4 message.

5 Next up, we have number 28, Kolson
6 Schlosser.

7 MR. SCHLOSSER: Hi, can you hear me?

8 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

9 MR. SCHLOSSER: Hi. My name is Kolson
10 Schlosser. It's spelled correctly there on the
11 schedule. I'm an associate professor in the
12 Department of Geography, Urban Studies and
13 Environmental Studies at Temple University. I hold
14 a PhD in Geography from Penn State where I primarily
15 researched the social and cultural implications of
16 environmental quality.

17 So mine will be kind of short. A lot
18 of people have already, you know, said a lot of
19 important things about climate change itself. I'd
20 like to focus my comments on some of the social
21 equity implications of RGGI.

22 This is a country where we love
23 talking about legacies. Legacies of founding
24 fathers, legacies of constitutional rights, legacies
25 of democratic governments. If those legacies are to

1 be granted any legitimacy in the public spear, we
2 must also recognize the legacies of racism, of
3 colonial exploitation, and of class exclusion that
4 reverberate throughout society still today.

5 If 2020 has taught us anything, it
6 must be how deeply and historically systemic racism
7 is etched into the social fabric. We know it's not
8 just in terms of generational poverty and police
9 brutality, but in terms of the continued exposure of
10 low income communities of color to the very worst
11 effects of industrial capitalism. But this is a
12 toxic exposure and are legacies like any other.

13 I can tell you that the causes of
14 these legacies of toxic exposure are, and absolutely
15 settle, the question in the academic world. While
16 the variables involved are complicated, where race
17 is still the single most important predicted
18 variable when it comes to the human geographic
19 patterns of exposure to air pollution.

20 I am here to argue that the revenue
21 created by RGGI should be used to proactively
22 redress such poisonous legacies. It should be used
23 to improve air quality monitoring in low income
24 communities. It should be used to improve energy
25 efficiency in such communities as well in order for

1 rate payers to save on utility bills as well as to
2 mitigate climate change.

3 The revenue can be used to fund
4 community solar for low income communities. It
5 could be directed towards creating new skills and
6 employment opportunities as we transition to a clean
7 energy future.

8 The DEP projects that RGGI will create
9 27,000 jobs and add \$1.9 billion to Pennsylvania's
10 economy by the year 2030, as it has already done in
11 other RGGI states. I'd argue that the moral
12 imperatives direct those jobs and dollars as much as
13 possible to communities historically impacted by our
14 fossil fuel dependent economy. I also want to echo
15 the policies that Wendy Greenspan mentioned earlier.

16 Pennsylvania's power generation sector
17 is the fifth most polluting in the country; a couple
18 of other people said fourth, so we'll go with their
19 number. Addressing this problem is a moral problem
20 because climate change itself is a moral crisis.

21 The fact that the sources of
22 greenhouse gas, at least the ones that we're here
23 today to discuss, coincide spatially with low income
24 communities makes it a moral problem in yet another
25 way. The rules for Pennsylvania's entry into RGGI

1 need to be written with equity in mind, which means
2 directing the revenues it creates to environmental
3 justice or climate change initiatives rather than
4 just going off to the general fund.

5 And I yield the rest of my time.
6 Thank you.

7 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Kolson.

8 I am told that William Sabey is on the
9 line. He just has his name listed as Bill.

10 MR. SABEY: Yes, can you hear me?

11 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

12 MR. SABEY: Great. Yes, thank you.

13 My name is William "Bill" Sabey. I
14 live in Plymouth Meeting, Pennsylvania. I support
15 Pennsylvania joining RGGI and I encourage this board
16 to do all it can to move the process along as
17 quickly as possible.

18 My interest in Pennsylvania joining RGGI
19 are the following benefits; reducing our state
20 emissions, improving our air quality and resulting
21 public health benefits, growth of green energy jobs
22 and businesses as an economic driver, improvement
23 stability in transportation energy efficiency, and
24 to support the economically disadvantaged and
25 underserved who are most impacted by the negative

1 impacts of climate change and air quality.

2 I'll just focus on a couple of these.
3 Regarding carbon emissions, Pennsylvania was ranked
4 the fifth highest emitter in the country based on a
5 2017 Energy Information Administration data. I
6 heard others tonight state that it's the fourth
7 emitter, but I believe fifth based on my reference.

8 EIA also ranked Pennsylvania as the
9 second energy producer in the country in 2018.
10 Being second sounds like it might be a good ranking
11 but when you realize we are the fifth carbon
12 emitter, it is not such a good thing for us to be
13 such a large provider of damaging CO2 emissions
14 energy to those who purchase from us.

15 And knowing the damage that CO2
16 emissions are causing to our planet with increasing
17 intensity of the rain, wind storms, wildfires and
18 drought, it is definitely not a good rank and for PA
19 to be the fourth or fifth emitter of emissions in
20 the U.S.

21 The hidden cost of emissions globally
22 for the economic impacts of these damaging weather
23 and environmental events are also called the social
24 cost of carbon. The social cost of carbon has been
25 estimated to be \$50 a metric ton in CO2 in 2020 and

1 increasing to \$82 a metric ton by 2050, based on an
2 office of management and budget study initiated in
3 2005.

4 The RGGI allowances estimated
5 permittees are a bargain compared to the real cost
6 these emissions are causing to the planet.
7 Regarding public health, the American Lung
8 Association has rated many of our Pennsylvania
9 counties on the severity of air pollution on a
10 public level and in the high ozone category, 36 of
11 our 67 counties received a grade. Thirty-one (31)
12 of those did not have enough data or did not report.

13 Of at least 36 that received a grade,
14 12 received an A or B, 9 received a C, 6 a D, and 9
15 an F. Since we all know how good breathing clean
16 air is, I propose that PA is failing its public
17 health with 24 of 36 counties not having the
18 cleanest air possible at 67 percent.

19 Along the 25 national cities with
20 worst rankings in the ozone category, Philadelphia,
21 Reading and Camden had the 23rd ranking. In the
22 year ground particulates category, Pittsburgh, New
23 Castle on the western side of the state were ranked
24 8th.

25 Philadelphia, Reading, and Camden were

1 ranked 12th. Also, Philadelphia was ranked as the
2 fourth worst city in the country for individuals
3 with asthma in the 2019 evaluation by Allergy and
4 Asthma Foundation of America.

5 The additional benefits of increasing
6 growth of green jobs and businesses approved energy
7 efficiency and conservation measures, economic
8 systems for those in our community who are
9 economically disadvantaged, underserved and most
10 impacted by the damaging impacts of these climate
11 crises are as important as the health and global
12 impacts of PA's carbon emissions and are documented
13 by others advocating for RGGI.

14 On behalf of all our PA residents and
15 future generations, I ask the Environmental Quality
16 Board and DEP to move to adopt and implement RGGI as
17 quickly as possible. It is time for Pennsylvania to
18 become a champion in reducing emissions, cleaning up
19 our air for our citizens' health, and transition to
20 be the leading generator and supplier of clean green
21 energy to the rest of the country.

22 We look forward to the time when we
23 can take pride in being ranked number one for green
24 and clean energy.

25 Thank you for the opportunity provided

1 to testify.

2 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Bill.

3 Next, we have number 29, Anna
4 Loudenslager.

5 MS. LOUDENSLAGER: My name is Anna
6 Loudenslager. Hi, can you hear me?

7 MS. SHIRLEY: You can begin. Yep.

8 MS. LOUDENSLAGER: Okay.

9 Good evening. My name is Anna
10 Loudenslager spelled A-N-N-A L-O-U-D-E-N-S-L-A-G-E-R
11 and I'm from Williamsport, Pennsylvania. I'm here
12 in support of the Regional Greenhouse Gas
13 Initiative, or RGGI.

14 Climate change is a real and eminent
15 threat. In 2018, 13 of our own federal agencies
16 released a report showing how global warming will
17 impact our country in the not so distant future. It
18 was to reduce agricultural yields due to crop
19 failures and increased wildfires damaging
20 infrastructure and supply chains, among the issues
21 we'll face by the end of this century.

22 It concluded that up to ten percent of
23 our nation's economy could be lost by the year 2100.
24 Failure to address global warming will also burden
25 our healthcare system through environmentally linked

1 maladies such as respiratory and cardiovascular
2 disease. Also increased numbers of severe weather
3 events that cause further disruption to our lives.

4 All told, many, many aspects of our
5 lives will be negatively affected if we don't take
6 significant action.

7 For many years, our federal government
8 has shown an unwillingness to take environmental
9 issues seriously. Congress has demonstrated very
10 little appetite to tackle big, bold legislative
11 initiatives, and an executive action taken by one
12 president can simply be undone by the next.

13 Our federal EPA is subject to budget
14 cuts and we get demonization brought on by those who
15 for some reason chose to deny the severity of issues
16 we all face. The United States has turned its back
17 on multinational climate change initiatives at least
18 twice, opting out of the Kyoto Protocol in the early
19 2000s and the Paris Agreement on November 4th of
20 this year.

21 For these reasons, leadership on
22 climate issues needs to come at the state level. In
23 RGGI, Pennsylvania has opportunity to join 11 other
24 eastern states in a cap-and-trade system that would
25 establish --- that was established in 2005. By

1 doing so, our states enjoy an organization that is
2 already established rather than trying to do
3 something just within our own state.

4 Since 2005, states belonging to RGGI
5 have reduced their power plant carbon emissions by
6 40 percent while their state economics have grown by
7 eight percent. While multiple factors have
8 contributed to those results, studies show that RGGI
9 plays a major role in achieving these numbers.

10 Once you look at the cost of carbon
11 allowances and compare it to the benefits of our
12 state and country, I hope you will support the
13 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Anna.

16 Next, we have number 31, Kelly Finan,
17 Finan (pronunciation change).

18 MS. FINAN: Hi. Yeah, I pronounce it
19 Finan but that's all right.

20 MS. SHIRLEY: Sorry.

21 MS. FINAN: That's okay.

22 So actually, I agree with Anna. And I
23 support --- I support RGGI. So I would actually
24 like to forfeit my --- my space. And I'll send in a
25 written testimony.

1 Do you still need me to spell my name
2 and give you my address? Hello?

3 MS. SHIRLEY: Sorry. I forgot I muted
4 myself.

5 MS. FINAN: That's okay.

6 MS. SHIRLEY: You can send your
7 comments to regcomments@pa.gov.

8 MS. FINAN: Okay. Great. And do you
9 need me to spell my name and/or give you my address
10 or anything right now?

11 MS. SHIRLEY: No.

12 MS. FINAN: Okay. Great. I'm all
13 set.

14 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Kelly.

15 MS. FINAN: Okay. Awesome. Thank
16 you.

17 MS. SHIRLEY: Next up, we have number
18 32, Char Magaro.

19 MS. MAGARO: Hi.

20 MS. SHIRLEY: Char, I think you might
21 have two Webex sessions open. If you can make sure
22 that you only have one open right now, that will
23 help us with the --- the feedback.

24 MR. JAGIELA: Char, could you try
25 talking to your phone? I have that unmuted right

1 now.

2 MS. MAGARO: Hello? Can you hear me?

3 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes, much better.

4 MS. MAGARO: Oh, I'm so sorry.

5 MS. SHIRLEY: That's okay.

6 You can begin.

7 MS. MAGARO: Excuse me?

8 MS. SHIRLEY: Sorry. I just said you
9 could begin.

10 MS. MAGARO: I reside in Enola,
11 Pennsylvania. Thank you for the opportunity to
12 testify on the importance of Pennsylvania's joining
13 RGGI.

14 I address the panel as a capitalist
15 environmentalist with 50 years of entrepreneurship
16 and 42 years as a climate advocate with the last 16
17 years as the member of the board of Penn Future,
18 ending with my last four years this year as the
19 board chair. I am testifying as a private citizen.

20 Addressing the climate crisis is sadly
21 60 years late, in large part because fossil fuel
22 industries influenced our leadership. So instead of
23 investing in clean energy production and emission
24 reduction, they've opted to invest in political
25 influence and climate denial propaganda.

1 Sadly, it has resulted, in large part,
2 to the weakening of Earth's ability to sustain a
3 living ecosystem. And we are very near the point of
4 diminishing returns.

5 Ever since President Carter put solar
6 panels on the White House in 1979 and formed a
7 think-tank to formulate a plan for a clean energy
8 economy, the fossil fuel industry has blocked and
9 debunked the existence of the climate crisis. Any
10 resistance here in Pennsylvania to joining RGGI is
11 only a familiar repeat of this scenario. And we,
12 the citizens, are still paying the price literally
13 and figuratively.

14 Pennsylvania, with the third largest
15 carbon footprint in the nation, has a moral,
16 economic, and constitutional responsibility to
17 engage in all viable vehicles to address carbon
18 reduction in order to ensure every citizen the right
19 to a healthy environment. The economic, health, and
20 environmental benefits of essentially a cap-and-
21 trade initiative like RGGI is only the first step to
22 carbon emission reduction. But it will prove that
23 addressing the climate crisis in this manner will
24 open more opportunities to build Pennsylvania's
25 economy, create jobs, reduce air pollution, and pave

1 the way for a more sustainable future.

2 Ever since the election, Pennsylvania
3 has gained the nation's attention. We must leverage
4 that attention to addressing this existential crisis
5 through climate leadership starting with our state
6 joining RGGI.

7 We have run out of time to do anything
8 else. I yield the rest of my time.

9 Thank you.

10 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Char.

11 Next, we have number 33, Lauren Kahn.

12 MS. KAHN: Hi. Can you hear me?

13 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes. Go ahead.

14 MS. KAHN: Thank you for the
15 opportunity to testify this evening about the
16 importance of Pennsylvanian joining the RGGI
17 initiative. My name is Lauren Kahn, L-A-U-R-E-N
18 K-A-H-N. I am a fourth generation resident of
19 Philadelphia and the co-founder of a new
20 organization called the Ecopsychology Alliance of
21 Philadelphia.

22 As an ecopsychologist, I believe that
23 a healthy planet is essential for the physical and
24 mental health of all the species that share it. It
25 is, therefore, essentially that humans do whatever

1 we can to ensure the health of the planet for the
2 sake of the Earth itself which in turn determines
3 the health and well-being of its inhabitants today
4 and for the future.

5 I'm speaking tonight because I believe
6 it is essential that Pennsylvania takes tangible
7 action in reducing our greenhouse gas emissions by
8 joining this initiative.

9 Our state is the fourth largest
10 producer of greenhouse gas emissions in the United
11 States. Governor Wolf has set an ambitious goal to
12 reduce these emissions by 26 percent by the year
13 2025. Enrolling in RGGI would be a tangible step in
14 the state's effort and commitment to reducing these
15 polluting emissions.

16 This program will provide more
17 affordable electricity to Pennsylvania residents and
18 just as beneficial, it will result in proceeds which
19 could be allocated to areas of the state that have
20 not only been disregarded but more importantly have
21 been negative impacted by these unhealthy emissions.
22 Additionally, the program would help protect
23 Pennsylvania's beautiful, natural ecosystem.

24 As an ecopsychologist, I know and see
25 firsthand the importance of being connected to

1 nature and how essential it is for people of all
2 ages to spend time outside in the fresh air. There
3 has been much research documenting the benefits of
4 the outdoors, including improved mood, decrease in
5 anxiety and depression, increased energy, weight
6 loss, and more positive self-esteem.

7 If Pennsylvania joins RGGI, the state
8 could use the money it would recover to fund
9 programs that would facilitate more opportunities
10 for people in the communities who have been most
11 negatively affected by the unhealthy emissions to
12 have more connections with nature.

13 With that money, organizations
14 including school districts, community centers, parks
15 and rec could provide programs that would encourage
16 and support children and their families to spend
17 more time outside. Programs involving agriculture,
18 gardening as well as science education about natural
19 ecosystems and the importance of preserving our
20 natural world.

21 Money could go to organizations like
22 Philadelphia Tree Tenders that plant trees in urban
23 areas. These programs would help children develop a
24 natural connection with nature and the desire to
25 care for it for themselves and future generations.

1 These programs can provide alternative food sources,
2 bring fresh grown vegetables to urban food deserts
3 and help with both the development of new and
4 preservation of existing playgrounds and parks.
5 It's time.

6 It is also important to note that the
7 communities being most affected by the toxicity of
8 the power plants are primarily communities of color.
9 In fact, according to an article in Climate by
10 Change, 85 percent of Pennsylvania's power plants
11 are located in or in close proximity to low income
12 communities and communities of color.

13 As we have seen this year, black
14 Americans are dying at an alarmingly higher rate
15 than white Americans due to Covid-19. This is in
16 large part due to underlying health conditions
17 including diabetes and asthma, both of which can be
18 caused by living in close proximity to power plants
19 and breathing in the CO2 emissions as well as other
20 harmful pollutants.

21 It is essential that the state uses
22 the money it would make back from being part of RGGI
23 to invest in these communities suffering from these
24 economic, educational, and racial disparities. It
25 is no secret that in Philadelphia especially, we

1 have an environmental crisis and that crisis is the
2 lack of exposure to healthy air and access to open
3 green spaces that everyone can enjoy.

4 I yield the remainder of my time.

5 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Lauren.

6 Next, we have number 34, Morton
7 Rubenstein.

8 MR. RUBENSTEIN: Can you hear me?

9 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

10 MR. RUBENSTEIN: Okay.

11 My name is Morton Rubenstein. First
12 name M-O-R-T-O-N, second name R-U-B-E-N-S-T-E-I-N.
13 I live in Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania. I support
14 joining RGGI.

15 I am a retired physician. I spent
16 nearly all of my medical career practicing pulmonary
17 medicine and internal medicine in the Commonwealth.
18 I also hold an MBA and worked in the insurance
19 industry. I belong to several environmental groups,
20 but today I'm speaking as a private citizen.

21 Pennsylvania makes an outside
22 contribution to the greenhouse gas emissions that
23 drive climate change. We must control these
24 emissions and RGGI would help us do that. RGGI
25 would reduce carbon emissions from the energy

1 sector. Carbon emissions have declined as cleaner
2 burning natural gas has replaced coal in power
3 plants. But the improvement will be temporary if we
4 don't transition to renewables.

5 Natural gas won't solve climate
6 change. It's an improvement over coal but it still
7 generates emissions. As RGGI decreases our
8 dependence on natural gas, both carbon dioxide
9 emissions and fugitive methane emissions will
10 decline.

11 Joining RGGI will serve as a market
12 signal, letting Pennsylvania's know that we're
13 serious about addressing climate change. This will
14 spur innovation and clean energy production and
15 boost our economy.

16 Despite assertions that RGGI will hurt
17 employment, data suggests that job creation
18 renewables occurs at a higher rate than in fossil
19 fuel industries. Coal continues to decline for
20 economic reasons. I favor subsidizing the
21 unemployed coal miners during retirement age,
22 retraining younger miners, and allocating
23 infrastructure projects to revitalize coal
24 communities, not propping up the coal industry.

25 Petroleum's future is also limited.

1 The automotive industry has made a large financial
2 debt on electric vehicles so oil demand will fall as
3 these new cars and trucks are rolled out over the
4 next ten years. We'll need natural gas for a couple
5 of decades but it's use will decline as it's
6 replaced by renewables which are now headed toward
7 price parity with natural gas.

8 As a physician, I've seen firsthand
9 the health consequences of fossil fuels. Increased
10 asthma case rates, exacerbations of other
11 cardiopulmonary diseases, more vector-borne
12 infections like Lyme's disease, heat-related illness
13 and more. And believe me, there's nothing more
14 heartbreaking than watching an asthma victim die in
15 front of you despite your best efforts.

16 Reducing harmful greenhouse gas
17 emissions and particulates will save lives and
18 reduce healthcare costs. Let's be clear. Climate
19 change is real. It's happening now and it will get
20 much worse if we fail to act. We need decisive
21 action now. Other measures will be needed but RGGI
22 is an important step forward.

23 I strongly recommend that Pennsylvania
24 join RGGI.

25 This concludes my remarks. Thank you

1 for your time and your attention.

2 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Dr.
3 Rubenstein.

4 Next, we have number 38, Georgia
5 Murray.

6 MS. MURRAY: Hi.

7 My name is Georgia Murray
8 G-E-O-R-G-I-A M-U-R-R-A-Y. I'm a staff scientist
9 and I'm representing the Appalachian Mountain Club
10 and I'm based in Gorham, New Hampshire. Thank you
11 for the opportunity to comment on the Commonwealth
12 of Pennsylvania's proposal to participate in the
13 regional greenhouse gas initiative CO2 budget
14 trading program.

15 The Appalachian Mountain Club has
16 5,000 members in our Delaware Valley Chapter, many
17 of whom are Pennsylvania residents. We have been
18 working on RGGI since it's inception as an important
19 climate action policy and we are very supportive of
20 Pennsylvania joining the ongoing program.

21 The AMC's mission is to foster the
22 pretension, enjoyment, and understanding of the
23 outdoors. We envision a world where our natural
24 resources are healthy, loved, and always protected
25 and where the outdoors occupies a place of central

1 importance in every person's life.

2 Climate altering pollution is already
3 impacting many aspects of our lives from costal sea
4 level rise to increased frequency and extreme storms
5 to low winter snow packs. Our region is warming
6 faster and experiencing more extreme events, heavy
7 precipitation, and intense storms than the rest of
8 the nation.

9 According to the latest data from
10 NOAA, Pennsylvania's annual temperature is warming
11 0.1 degree Fahrenheit per decade and precipitation
12 has increased by 0.37 inches per decade. The
13 accelerated warming and intense storms are patterns
14 that are projected to continue across our region.

15 Limiting greenhouse gas emissions
16 through this regional market-based approach is an
17 effective strategy to mitigating climate change.
18 And by joining RGGI, the Commonwealth will be one
19 step closer to fully implementing the strategies in
20 its most recent climate action plan.

21 It has been estimated that by joining
22 RGGI, the Commonwealth will prevent 188 million tons
23 of carbon dioxide pollution which represents a 25
24 percent decrease from 2022 to 2030.

25 The evidence is clear that RGGI's

1 existing framework is working. Across the RGGI
2 region, we have seen more than 40 percent decrease
3 in carbon pollution while electricity prices have
4 declined since the program began.

5 The program is also a job maker. And
6 for Pennsylvania, it's predicted to result in a net
7 increase of 27,000 jobs and add 1.9 billion to the
8 state's economy. The co-benefits of addressing
9 power plant emissions and investing in energy
10 efficiency and cleaner energy generation will also
11 improve the lives of Pennsylvanians.

12 The Commonwealth has struggled to
13 improve ambient air quality in some regions of the
14 state. For example, based on the 2019 monitoring
15 data, three southeast Pennsylvania counties sought
16 exceedances of the 2015 ozone health standard.

17 Pennsylvania DEP modeling predicts
18 that joining RGGI will result in cumulative emission
19 reductions of 112,000 tons of nitrogen oxide and
20 approximately 67,000 tons of sulfur dioxide over a
21 decade, which will prevent premature deaths and
22 hospital visits from respiratory disease.

23 There is evidence that RGGI has and
24 can continue to achieve significant health benefits.
25 A recent study from Ferrara et al 2020 looked at

1 the impacts of changes in ambient PM2.5
2 concentrations on health endpoints for children such
3 as low birth weight and instance of asthma. The
4 study found that not only did RGGI states avoid
5 cases of these negative health effects but that the
6 program benefited neighboring states as well,
7 including Pennsylvania.

8 By joining RGGI, the state can further
9 improve air quality for its residents in regions
10 with persistent high pollution and in overburdened
11 communities of color. The need for reducing
12 particulates and ozone is even more urgent as
13 science mounts that respiratory health is linked to
14 overall ability to fight diseases such as Covid-19.

15 As Pennsylvania joins the RGGI market,
16 we urge the Commonwealth to ensure an open and
17 transparent process and make efforts to incorporate
18 input from communities directly impacted by power
19 plant pollution.

20 Thank you for this opportunity to
21 comment today. I look forward to submitting more
22 detailed written comments before the close of the
23 comment period.

24 Thank you.

25 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Georgia.

1 Next, we have number 36, Tom Pike.

2 MR. PIKE: Hi. Can everyone hear me?

3 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

4 MR. PIKE: Good evening.

5 My name is Tom Pike; that's T-O-M
6 P-I-K-E. And I was born and raised in Murrysville
7 in Westmoreland County where I currently live.

8 As a child, when the forest behind my
9 home was threatened with development, I watched my
10 mother organize our neighbors to resist it. Today,
11 the forest still stands because of her work.

12 I was taught that my community valued
13 self-sufficiency and responsibility and that these
14 principles applied equally towards stewardship of
15 our plant as they did to our family's checkbook.

16 But while my family worked to minimize
17 its own impact, the corporations in our backyard did
18 not. I watched in frustration as new fossil fuel
19 power plants were built throughout my lifetime, even
20 though for decades prior to my birth the fossil fuel
21 industry understood the impacts of what it was
22 doing.

23 Leaked papers dating back to the 1960s
24 show that oil and gas company scientists accurately
25 predicted the scale and impacts of climate change

1 and then the company systematically sought to
2 mislead the public and buy enough political power
3 that they would never be held accountable.

4 I understood even as a child that the
5 impacts of my own personal contributions would be
6 meaningless if utilities kept building new coal
7 plants. I remember realizing in college that every
8 web page I refreshed and every email I sent was
9 powered by someone who got black lung for it.

10 In the 19th century, my hometown
11 Murrys ville was the site of a construction of the
12 first commercial gas well in the country. This is
13 treated like a local point of pride. Gas well was
14 even a blazoned on the city's --- (technical blip).
15 I don't know why my community would be proud of
16 that. The Haymaker Well caught fire and burned in
17 one of the worst manmade disasters to ever strike
18 the region. The flames could not be extinguished.
19 It burned for many months.

20 The flames were so high into the sky
21 that they could be seen from Pittsburgh 20 miles
22 away. You would think we would have learned from
23 that. Yet a century later, in 2015 in Los Angeles,
24 the Aliso Canyon Gas Storage Facility blew out,
25 poisoning the air by tens of thousands, forcing

1 evacuations, and spewing 100,000 metric tons of
2 methane into the atmosphere.

3 Methane is 80 times more potent as
4 greenhouse gas than carbon dioxide. That facility
5 still has not been shut down.

6 We have learned nothing. We have
7 legislated nothing. And the for-profit driven
8 fossil fuel industry which began in my literal
9 backyard has spread like a cancer across the world.

10 As I speak, giving this public
11 comment, my computer is powered by a coal and gas-
12 fired electric grid. Someone got black lung so I
13 can give this testimony.

14 I urge that we immediately join RGGI
15 and that the conversation quickly move onto the next
16 climate reforms we must pass. The State of
17 Pennsylvania has played a key role in allowing the
18 fossil fuel industry to just destroy our world. We
19 must work to redeem ourselves and that work must
20 begin today.

21 Thank you.

22 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Tom.

23 Next, we have number 37,
24 Representative Sara Innamorato.

25 MS. INNAMORATO: Hello everybody.

1 Yes, can you hear me?

2 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

3 MS. INNAMORATO: Wonderful.

4 Well, thank you for having me this
5 evening. I'm State Representative Sara Innamorato
6 and I live in Allegheny County and my primary
7 responsibility is to protect the public good of all
8 Pennsylvanians.

9 This evening I am speaking as a
10 citizen though, a citizen with asthma. I'm speaking
11 on behalf of all of my neighbors in the
12 Commonwealth.

13 So I believe that joining RGGI, this
14 cap-and-invest program, is a small step towards
15 placing the cost of pollution where it belongs, on
16 the polluters. And one that is essential --- an
17 essential component for our collective effort to
18 address anthropogenic climate change here in
19 Pennsylvania.

20 We have witnessed what our inaction to
21 address climate change has done for our climate with
22 a rise of more than 1.8 degrees Fahrenheit over the
23 past century due to increase in greenhouse gas
24 emissions. And this has lead to extreme weather
25 events including floods, heavier snowfalls, heat

1 wave, and drought.

2 I live here in Pittsburgh,
3 Pennsylvania. And I live just a few city blocks
4 away from the Allegheny River. That means I'm in an
5 area that is rich in water and hills, and I have
6 experienced what the impact these extreme weather
7 events have had on my neighbors. Not only has their
8 homes flooded but I've actually seen many of our
9 state and local roads literally fall down the
10 hillside.

11 And the cost to the individuals in
12 municipality's budge has been astronomical. But in
13 addition to the costs for homes and infrastructure,
14 the residents of Pennsylvania are paying for our
15 governing bodies' inactions with the health and
16 well-being of themselves and their families through
17 increased cases of childhood asthma, pre-term birth
18 and low term birth weights, heart and lung disease,
19 and illnesses caused by disease carriers such as
20 mosquitoes and ticks.

21 The Pittsburgh region is also known,
22 according to the American Lung Association, as one
23 of the most polluted metro areas and consistently
24 received failing grades for our failure to meet
25 basic air quality standards.

1 If we joined RGGI, it is estimated
2 that we may see a reduction in emissions ---
3 greenhouse gas emissions by more than 188 million
4 tons over the course of the next decade, realigning
5 the co-benefits of reducing air pollution while
6 improving human health.

7 Through 2030, according to the DEP
8 estimates, we would reduce premature deaths by more
9 than 600 and reduce lost work days by 83,000 if we
10 do move forward with the proposed emission
11 reductions.

12 Not only would we reduce these
13 emissions, but it would lead to a net economic
14 benefit of more than \$1.9 billion and create
15 thousands of quality jobs that most importantly
16 cannot be outsourced.

17 Simply put, RGGI has the potential to
18 save lives and livelihoods. And during this period
19 of economic uncertainty due to Covid-19, it would be
20 foolish and fiscally irresponsible to ignore the
21 significant economic investing in our Commonwealth's
22 future.

23 But many of these communities in which
24 power generating facilities operate have been
25 subjected to booms and pollution-lagging busts,

1 through decades of legislative inaction, we have
2 normalized diminished property values, limited job
3 opportunities, unexplained health ailments and
4 public agencies prioritizing business interests over
5 those in the community in these resident's minds for
6 decades.

7 So while modeling shows us that we
8 have a positive benefit in RGGI when it comes to our
9 environment and economics, we need to ensure that we
10 right these rules so that they actually benefit the
11 frontline environmental justice communities that
12 have bore the burden of our energy production for
13 far too long.

14 So I do ask for some specific
15 considerations to be reviewed during this process.
16 My time is dwindling so I will go ahead and forward
17 those --- the email to everyone and, you know, just
18 to say that joining RGGI is not the fantasy for all
19 our environmental and economic challenges, but it is
20 an important and significant step in combating
21 global climate change in our own backyard.

22 So thank you for the time this
23 evening.

24 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you,
25 Representative.

1 Next, we have number 38, Magdalena
2 Sikora.

3 MS. SIKORA: Hello.

4 My name is Magdalena Sikora. My name
5 is spelled correctly on the screen. I'm a resident
6 of State College, Pennsylvania. My family has been
7 here for 28 years. Thank you so much for this
8 opportunity to testify on behalf of the regional
9 greenhouse gas initiative.

10 Pennsylvania's entrance into RGGI is
11 wonderful news as carbon pollution is expected to be
12 cut by 21 percent by the year 2030. While this does
13 fall short of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate
14 Change's goals of 45 percent reduction by 2030, we
15 desperately need this in our state as we are the
16 fourth highest emitter of greenhouse gases in the
17 nation, which is the second largest emitter in the
18 world.

19 I testify today to ask that RGGI goes
20 into effect with rules and regulations that ensure
21 Pennsylvania is reducing greenhouse gas emissions
22 significantly and equally across the entire state
23 and communities bearing the heaviest burdens from
24 our reliance on fossil fuels are protected and
25 funded.

1 This past summer was the hottest on
2 record in State College. While fortunate to have
3 air conditioning in our home, we found it broken at
4 the beginning of the summer, but we could not get an
5 appointment for repair until the end of August as
6 the pandemic had created a backlog.

7 My mom and I spent a humid 90 plus,
8 100 plus degrees summer days hot and uncomfortable,
9 struggling to stay sharp and focused at work or to
10 find exercise even possible.

11 We are also a family in grief, so
12 these hot days without respite were extremely
13 difficult. It was difficult to be an efficient
14 employee. It was difficult to get through the days.

15 But this summer is our new norm. The average
16 temperatures in Pennsylvania are forecasted to keep
17 increasing and days with a heat index above 90
18 degrees will total around 40 a year.

19 As humans encroach on more wildlife
20 habitats, we expose ourselves to animals carrying
21 potential pandemic causing viruses. So this
22 devastating pandemic may happen again. Tick and
23 mosquito borne illnesses are also on the rise with
24 the warming climate without the sustained freezing
25 temperatures we used to have during the winter.

1 For the first time in 28 years of
2 living here, my mom developed what doctors believe
3 to be anaplasmosis from a tick bite in our yard last
4 summer. Another friend's mother, the same. Without
5 antibiotics, I'd have lost my mom and I'm sure many
6 of you have also had a similar situation.

7 Oh, and also a fun fact is that with
8 the increasing number of these bacterial infections,
9 antibiotic use also rises, spreading the risk of
10 antibiotic-resistant bacteria across the globe.

11 But still, I live in a location spared
12 from the most overt and significant impacts of air
13 and water contamination. I have to drive quite far
14 until I see a power plant or a natural gas well. I
15 was 200 miles away when the Philadelphia Energy
16 Solutions Refinery exploded last year.

17 And so I call for the Pennsylvania
18 Department of Energy to ensure the protections for
19 environmental justice communities within their RGGI
20 rule making. I ask for no less than 50 percent of
21 the revenue generated through the cap-and-invest
22 system to be directed towards projects intended to
23 develop renewable energy infrastructure or pollution
24 mitigation to abolish food deserts or to develop
25 green spaces.

1 I ask that these projects protect
2 communities from future harm practices or rightly
3 unjust practices they've had to endure. I ask that
4 RGGI not allow polluters to pass their energy cost
5 to those with the least. Large fossil fuel
6 companies have had their day and we need to ----
7 now, we need to clean and protect our planet and
8 those living on it.

9 I ask that when issuing air pollution
10 permits, the Department take environmental justice
11 into account. For instance, the Clean Air Act does
12 not determine whether another polluting facility is
13 already nearby when they issue permits. I ask that
14 RGGI not allow fossil fuels power plants to increase
15 their emissions. We must ensure RGGI provides
16 nothing short of emission reductions on all fronts.

17 And finally, RGGI should guarantee
18 implantation of specific, publicly available follow-
19 up studies on the effects of the program in order to
20 prevent any unforeseen, detrimental incentives, or
21 effects of the cap-and-invest market that is put in
22 place.

23 Since we speak in terms of economic
24 productivity in this country, I can say that all of
25 us are better workers when we have clean spaces to

1 rest our minds as was mentioned by an earlier
2 speaker. And also when we have access to food and
3 an environment that keeps us healthy. We must
4 protect the only home we have. It is the right
5 thing to do for ourselves and our planet.

6 Thank you.

7 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Magdalena.

8 Next, we have number 39, Stephanie
9 Ulmer.

10 MS. ULMER: Okay.

11 My name is Stephanie Ulmer. My name
12 is spelled correctly and I live just outside of
13 Pittsburgh.

14 Pennsylvania needs to accept the
15 reality of climate change and join the Regional
16 Greenhouse Gas Initiative. Coal still makes up
17 about 17 percent of Pennsylvania's electricity
18 portfolio and the mining and burning of coal still
19 results in a significant release of carbon dioxide
20 pollution.

21 Natural gas is mostly replacing coal
22 now but if our power grids continue to rely heavily
23 on natural gas, carbon emissions alone will still be
24 too high by mid-century to limit global warming to
25 1.5 degrees Celsius.

1 Pennsylvania needs to switch to
2 renewables ASAP. Joining RGGI will help us make
3 that switch by putting a price on carbon emissions.
4 RGGI would by the DEP's own estimates decrease PA's
5 carbon pollution by 25 percent by 2030; not enough
6 of course but enough to make sure there is progress
7 in our quest to reduce greenhouse gas initiatives in
8 a timely fashion.

9 RGGI has yielded net economic benefit
10 to those states who already participate in almost \$4
11 billion in less than a decade. Close to \$6 billion
12 has been saved in these same states as a result of
13 increased public health as their air quality
14 improves. In other words, adopting RGGI has brought
15 the collective helpers of its member states about a
16 billion dollars a year.

17 Meanwhile, according to Earth Track,
18 Pennsylvania spends almost \$3 billion a year
19 subsidizing fossil fuels and related industries,
20 industries which degrade and fragment our wildlife
21 habitat, forcing our soils and pollute our water and
22 air.

23 And it is the Pennsylvania taxpayer
24 who shoulders the cost for repairing this damaged
25 water and air environment when repair is even

1 possible and caring for an increasingly sickened
2 population.

3 Joining RGGI will help us transition
4 to renewables by putting the price on carbon
5 emissions. As we all know by now, Pennsylvania is
6 the fourth largest emitter of carbon dioxide
7 pollution in the country. And we all know too what
8 the repercussions of continuing PA's whole-hearted
9 embrace of petrochemicals oil, gas, and coal are.
10 We will experience more frequent and intense storms
11 with heavier downpours. In-between, we will have
12 more, prolonged droughts. We will have increasingly
13 early springs that are often followed by killing
14 frosts later in the season. Our summers will be
15 hotter, making outdoor work more dangerous.

16 Human and animal populations will
17 become sicker. We are seeing these changes already.
18 What will happen to our food supply in this
19 scenario? Where would we turn for clean drinkable
20 water? What about the cost of flooding and
21 landslides on roadways and other transportation
22 networks? How will our power lines, natural gas,
23 and other fossil fuel infrastructure even hold up
24 under the stress of these storms and unstable
25 ground?

1 There are many sensible and doable
2 solutions out there to address climate change that
3 will move us away from our dependence on fossil
4 fuels while at the same time addressing implied
5 workers and small businesses reliant on these
6 industries for their paychecks as well as those
7 parts of the population who are bearing the brunt of
8 fossil fuel pollution.

9 RGGI is one of these solutions, one of
10 these possible solutions. And there is no good
11 reason not to join.

12 And I just want to thank everyone else
13 for their wonderful testimony and also for the
14 patience of everyone who has sat here and listened
15 to us and will continue to listen for another couple
16 of hours.

17 Thank you so much.

18 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Stephanie. I
19 agree. Thank you everyone for your --- for your
20 patience tonight.

21 Next up, we have number 40, Richard
22 Marcil.

23 Do we have Richard? Yes.

24 MR. MARCIL: Yes. You hear me now?

25 MS. SHIRLEY: Yep. You can begin.

1 MR. MARCIL: Oh, oh good, good.

2 Good evening. Yes, I'm Richard
3 Marcil, that's M-A-R-C-I-L. I'm a Harrisburg
4 resident and a student at Widener University
5 Commonwealth Law School here in Harrisburg and I'm
6 speaking this evening as a representative of
7 Widener's Environmental Law and Policy Society.

8 The society is a student organization
9 that educates students and the community of local,
10 national and global environmental issues. It also
11 provides students with opportunities to become
12 involved in issues and to learn about career
13 opportunities in environmental law.

14 The society strongly supports the
15 proposed RGGI regulation because it will help our
16 state and our nation mitigate the harmful impacts of
17 climate change while creating important job
18 opportunities in Pennsylvania.

19 Over the summer, I conducted research
20 into how RGGI states use the funds they raise
21 through auctions of carbon allowances. My research
22 considered the enacting legislation and regulation
23 of all current RGGI member states as well as
24 publicly available data from the RGGI organization
25 to identify best practices in RGGI revenue

1 investment. I will include the paper along with my
2 written statement.

3 The regulation under consideration
4 today wisely capitalizes on the lessons and
5 experiences of those other states. Specifically,
6 the planned investment in greenhouse gas abatement,
7 renewable energy and energy efficiency are
8 consistent with three of the four major categories
9 of investment of RGGI auction proceeds as well as
10 with the expenditure provisions circumscribing
11 Pennsylvania's clean air fund.

12 While the fourth major category
13 employed by other RGGI states direct subsidization
14 of low income consumer electric bills is not
15 included in Pennsylvania's investment mix. Other
16 measures that support environmental justice
17 principles are.

18 The RGGI program must be implemented
19 so as to ensure that energy efficiency measures,
20 access to renewable energy sources, and GHB
21 abatement efforts promote social equity and benefit
22 our poorest and most vulnerable citizens.

23 For this reason, the regulation should
24 explicitly allow for RGGI's money to be invested in
25 outreach, education, and worker retraining. While

1 current RGGI member states contribute little to no
2 funds for these areas, they are nevertheless crucial
3 if Pennsylvania is to ensure a just transition from
4 an economy and energy generation model based on
5 extractive industries to one based on clean energy.

6 Additionally, Pennsylvania should not
7 allow transfers of RGGI proceeds into the general
8 fund. Those transfers as discouraged by the RGGI
9 model legislation and would inspire a negative
10 public reaction as they did in New York,
11 Connecticut, and New Jersey when the legislatures
12 there attempted to move RGGI funds into the general
13 fund.

14 Moreover, transfers to the general
15 funds would be inconsistent with RGGI's primary
16 purpose and goal which is fighting climate change.
17 I will close now simply by echoing a few points that
18 have already been made more eloquently by others.

19 First, RGGI is constitutionally
20 mandated under article 1 section 27 of the
21 Pennsylvania Constitution. The constitution places
22 a trusty responsibility on the state to conserve and
23 maintain Pennsylvania's natural resources for the
24 benefit of all people.

25 Consistent with this mandate, it is

1 incumbent upon the state and all levels of
2 government to ensure clean air and a clean
3 atmosphere. The proposed RGGI regulation enhances
4 the state's ability to fulfill its duty as trustee
5 and should therefore be approved.

6 Second, research has demonstrated that
7 in RGGI states, CO2 emissions from power plants fell
8 by 45 percent from a base level measured between
9 2006 and 2008 and about half of those reductions are
10 attributable directly to the RGGI program. In other
11 words, RGGI works.

12 Third, RGGI is an engine for economic
13 growth. A 2018 study from Analysis Group found that
14 RGGI had about \$1.4 billion in economic value added
15 between 2015 and 2017. It found that RGGI
16 compliance lead to overall job gain. Those jobs
17 include workers who perform efficiency audits and to
18 install energy efficiency measures --- measures in
19 residential and commercial buildings and staff
20 performing training on energy issues. DEP
21 projections show a net increase of 27,000 jobs under
22 RGGI.

23 Finally, RGGI must only be a first
24 step. The DEP must fight climate change not only by
25 minimizing GHG emissions from power plants but also

1 from the transportation of industrial and
2 agriculture sectors.

3 Thank you for allowing me the
4 opportunity to testify today and for the proposing
5 this important regulation. I yield the remainder of
6 my time.

7 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Richard.
8 Next, we have number 41, William Berg.

9 MR. BERG: Hi, can you hear me?

10 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

11 MR. BERG: Okay great.

12 Hello. My name is William Berg and it
13 is spelled correctly on the register. And I live in
14 Nottingham, Pennsylvania in Chester County with my
15 wife of 19 years and three teenage daughters.

16 Thank you for the opportunity to speak
17 to you tonight.

18 I would like to express my strong
19 support for Pennsylvania's entry into the RGGI
20 Initiative. I support Pennsylvania joining RGGI
21 because it is a program that will work for
22 Pennsylvania. Specifically, Pennsylvania will
23 benefit from a market-based greenhouse gas
24 reductions program that charges polluting resources
25 for some portion of the pollution they create.

1 Charging polluters for the pollution
2 they create is a simple, cost effective, and time-
3 tested approach to reducing harmful emissions.

4 Second, RGGI has been around for more
5 than ten years and in that time, delivered proven
6 and significant results to participating states in
7 terms of carbon emissions, economic growth, and
8 healthier air. These benefits could be ours too
9 once Pennsylvania joins RGGI.

10 By supporting RGGI, I'm also standing
11 up for nuclear power and all clean energy resources
12 in Pennsylvania. Under RGGI, clean energy resources
13 will be rewarded for being clean and polluting power
14 plants will pay at least some small portion of the
15 social and health cost of carbon emissions they
16 release into the air.

17 For these reasons and more, I ask the
18 Department of Environmental protection to move
19 forward --- to move Pennsylvania forward on clean
20 energy by entering our Commonwealth into RGGI.

21 Thank you for your time and
22 consideration, and I yield back the balance of my
23 time.

24 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, William.

25 Next, we have number 42, Chip

1 Hollister. I believe we could not find Chip on the
2 line. So Chip, if you are calling in from a
3 different phone number than you gave us, please
4 contact us and let us know.

5 Next, we have number 43, Mark Smith.

6 MR. SMITH: Good evening.

7 My name is Mark Smith. I live in
8 Philadelphia and am speaking as a citizen in support
9 of our Commonwealth becoming the 11th state to join
10 the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

11 RGGI is already a resounding success
12 in the ten states currently enrolled in the program.
13 Reducing greenhouse emissions by over a third,
14 raising \$3 billion for clean energy reinvestments
15 and outpacing states not participating in the
16 program by over 90 percent in emissions reductions.

17 That, and analysis by Pennsylvania's
18 Department of Environmental Protection indicates
19 that Pennsylvania will have a similar benefit,
20 creating over 27,000 jobs and adding \$1.9 billion to
21 the state's economy.

22 The climate is changing dramatically
23 from the burning of fossil fuels, but the pollution
24 they cause has another more immediate effect on
25 public health, especially for disadvantaged and

1 people of color who tend to live in closest
2 proximity to power plants.

3 As a major electricity producer,
4 Pennsylvania can transform from one of the most
5 polluting states to one that experiences a \$6
6 billion savings in health benefits by 2030 that
7 would include a reduction in tens of thousands of
8 asthma attacks and fewer cases of childhood
9 bronchitis.

10 The average temperature is expected to
11 rise by 5.4 degrees by 2050. And the number of days
12 with a heat index above 90 will increase from 8 to
13 40 per year. Extreme summer heat will affect urban,
14 poor, and people of color inordinately, not only
15 because they have less resources to respond but
16 because the heat island affects many urban areas
17 with higher amounts of heat absorbing concrete and
18 asphalt and have daily temperature differences of 10
19 to 20 degrees compared to suburban and rural areas.

20 The forecasted increases in
21 temperatures and changes in climate without taking
22 action will have a major impact on Pennsylvania's
23 agricultural economy as well.

24 RGGI will be a positive catalyst for
25 the market forces already in action as the country

1 transforms to sustainable methods of power
2 generation that do not include the burning of fossil
3 fuels.

4 Even though the jobs created in the
5 new energy economy will grow Pennsylvania's overall
6 employment numbers, it will be important to use
7 income from RGGI to specifically address people
8 employed in industries directly affected in the
9 transition.

10 Lower income groups that will be
11 inordinately disadvantaged by climate change should
12 have a significant portion of RGGI income made
13 available for home repair, weatherization, and
14 relief from RGGI related rate increases.

15 Changes in economy and employment for
16 Pennsylvania and the country have been constantly
17 transforming since the early days of the nation.
18 And our ability to change along with it is part of
19 our success.

20 As an example, I have lived in
21 Pennsylvania for 34 years but grew up in Ohio. Most
22 of my ancestors arrived from Europe through the port
23 of Philadelphia and farmed for several generations
24 in various parts of Pennsylvania before moving to
25 Ohio to continue farming.

1 My parents, for the last generation,
2 grew up on farms. As an adult, my father was
3 employed by the local electric utility and worked
4 with farmers in making the transition to electricity
5 and automation in their dairy operations.

6 So agriculture, industry, and the ways
7 in which we obtain energy will continue to change.
8 However, this is an exceptional time that requires
9 foresight into a future that will have catastrophic
10 results if the crisis of climate change is not met
11 head on.

12 Systemic changes are needed to work
13 more effectively together as a country and support
14 the sustainable market forces that are shaping our
15 future.

16 RGGI's already proven record of
17 success demonstrates support for business and
18 families while dramatically curbing CO2 emissions.
19 I urge the DEP to make the adjustments recommended,
20 affirm the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, and
21 pass it on to the governor for implementation.

22 Thank you for your time.

23 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Mark.

24 And I just want to take a moment to
25 remind everyone to email your written testimony to

1 regcomment@pa.gov so that we can make sure that we
2 capture everything and it's accurate.

3 Next up, we have number 44, David
4 Thomas Roberts.

5 Do we have David on the line?

6 MR. ROBERTS: Yes. I am David
7 Roberts. I am testifying as a private citizen. Can
8 you hear me all right?

9 I'm here.

10 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

11 I'm sorry, I'm having a little bit of
12 difficulty with my mute button.

13 I can hear you. I'm going to start
14 your timer. Okay?

15 MR. ROBERTS: You can hear me?

16 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

17 MR. ROBERTS: Okay.

18 Yes. My name is David Thomas Roberts,
19 R-O-B-E-R-T-S, testifying as a private citizen.

20 I reside on Purdue Mountain in
21 Bellefonte, Pennsylvania. I'm 68 years old and
22 retired from a career as an environmental
23 sanitarian. Thank you for the opportunity to
24 comment on this important issue.

25 I fully support the proposed CO2 budge

1 trading program regulation to bring Pennsylvania to
2 the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative. This will
3 provide a proven and effective market-based approach
4 to reduce greenhouse gases.

5 Overwhelming scientific evidence tells
6 us that emissions of greenhouse gases must be
7 drastically reduced right now to avoid catastrophic
8 climate change. Negative climate warming effects
9 are causing extreme weather events, brutally hot
10 summers, flash flooding and periodic droughts.

11 Here in Benner Township, the Purdue
12 Mountain Road was washed out from an extreme weather
13 event. It took more than a year and over a million
14 dollars to repair and stabilize the road. Also, the
15 foundation of the house downstream from Purdue
16 Mountain Road was undermined and major stream bank
17 stabilization was needed to prevent the house from
18 collapsing.

19 During that event, my rain gauge
20 recorded seven inches of rain. My basement flooded
21 and one of my cats nearly drowned.

22 I do not wish to see another such
23 extreme weather event caused by our carbon
24 emissions.

25 Clean, reliable energy is important to

1 us all. My home has electric heat and air
2 conditioning and I'm living on a limited retirement
3 income. Participation of Pennsylvania in RGGI
4 should result in long-term reduction of residential
5 electric bills. Reduced energy cost is a very
6 important issue for me and for all of Pennsylvania.

7 RGGI will directly and positively
8 affect me and my family members in many ways. I and
9 several family members suffer from intermittent
10 respiratory problems. We will benefit from improved
11 air quality through the reduction of carbon dioxide,
12 nitrogen oxides, sulfuric dioxide, particulate
13 matter and ground level ozone emissions for fossil
14 fuel-fired energy plants.

15 Prevention of costly infrastructure
16 damage from climate heating caused by greenhouse
17 gases will help keep our taxes down and enable our
18 economy to function smoothly. Promotion and
19 implementation of energy efficiency and renewable
20 energy jobs will save money, improve our economy,
21 and create well-paying green jobs.

22 I come from a family of Welsh
23 coalminers. My father and my grandfather worked the
24 coal mines in the Wilkes-Barre area. I also worked
25 for a time in coalmining when I was much younger.

1 However, it is time to transition from coal and gas
2 to clean energy and to the jobs that go with the
3 green energy economy.

4 Investment from CO2 allowance auction
5 proceeds can help improve energy efficiency such as
6 by re-insulating old, poorly insulated homes,
7 helping reduce the energy cost of people on limited
8 incomes like me while further reducing CO2
9 emissions.

10 The RGGI program is a win-win
11 situation for Pennsylvania and the Northwest Region.
12 The U.S. is the second highest emitter in world. I
13 want to be part of a state and a nation that is
14 striving to reduce carbon emissions, fight climate
15 change, preserve our wonderful health and climate
16 for generations to come.

17 I concur with Patrick McDonald,
18 secretary of DEP who stated, as a major electricity
19 producer, Pennsylvania has a significant opportunity
20 to reduce emissions and demonstrate its commitment
21 to addressing climate change through a program with
22 a proven track record.

23 I also agree with Governor Wolf's
24 executive order instructing DEP to join RGGI. As a
25 citizen and permanent resident of Pennsylvania, I

1 fully support Pennsylvania joining the Regional
2 Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

3 Thank you very much.

4 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, David.

5 Next, we have number 45, Dana Siler.

6 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see Dana on the
7 line.

8 MS. SHIRLEY: Okay. Dana, if you are
9 on the line and are calling in from a different
10 number than you gave us, please let us know.

11 Next up, we have number 46, R. Scott
12 Brown.

13 MR. BROWN: Good evening.

14 MS. SHIRLEY: Good evening.

15 MR. BROWN: How you doing? My name is
16 Scott Brown. I live in the historic village of
17 Chadds Ford in Delaware County, Pennsylvania. I
18 want to thank Governor Wolf and the Pennsylvania
19 Department of Environmental Protection for holding
20 these public hearings and providing the opportunity
21 to share my thoughts as a citizen of the
22 Commonwealth.

23 I'm here today to strongly support and
24 voice my support for Pennsylvania's entry into the
25 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, or RGGI.

1 The main reasons I support
2 Pennsylvania joining RGGI are the following. First,
3 health. The impact of greenhouse gas emissions from
4 burning fossil fuels to produce electricity creates
5 air pollution from the byproducts of those emissions
6 from these plants that have been proven by the
7 federal government and independent groups like the
8 American Lung Association to directly lead to lung
9 disease, asthma, and premature death.

10 This is magnified by the Covid-19
11 pandemic that directly impacts respiratory systems
12 and those with preexisting conditions like the
13 impacts listed previously.

14 Second reason, it is the
15 responsibility of the Commonwealth to ensure clean
16 air for its citizens. The federal government,
17 through the Environmental Protection Agency and the
18 courts, have found that carbon emissions are a
19 pollutant. So the governor and the DEP have the
20 responsibility to the citizens of the Commonwealth
21 to take action to reduce this form of pollution.

22 Third, climate change is real. Many
23 respected experts, including Pennsylvania
24 institutions like Penn State University and Carnegie
25 Mellon University, agree that climate change is

1 resulting in more severe weather, drastic
2 temperature swings, increased wind speeds, and
3 rising water levels that are impacting our everyday
4 lives and will only get worse for the next
5 generation if action to slow this down is not taken.

6 And finally, fairness. Fossil
7 generators are allowed to dump their waste,
8 greenhouse gas emissions, and other air pollutants
9 into the air we breathe, and they pay no fees or
10 consequences. This is a form of free ridership that
11 we, the citizens of the Commonwealth, subsidize with
12 our health on realized revenues and the loss of
13 progress to slow and reverse climate change.

14 Also, RGGI means Pennsylvania's four
15 nuclear power plants have an opportunity to compete
16 on a more level playing field by requiring that
17 polluting fossil fuel plants to pay some of the
18 social costs and health costs of carbon emissions
19 that they release into our air.

20 On this issue of fairness, there are
21 two primary options for reducing emissions. First,
22 you can reward clean generators. Pennsylvania does
23 this now with renewable --- with the renewable
24 energy portfolio standard that mandates clean,
25 renewable energy. But it failed to do this for

1 nuclear generators in Pennsylvania. And this
2 directly lead to the unfortunate action of
3 prematurely closing Three Mile Island Nuclear Plant
4 in 2019, one of the largest sources of zero
5 emissions energy for the state.

6 A second option is to charge a fee to
7 polluters for the right to dump their waste in the
8 state. This has been shown to be more efficient
9 with a market-based program that auctions off
10 permissions to pollute and uses these funds to
11 invest in clean resources.

12 RGGI is a form of this second option.
13 So why RGGI for Pennsylvania? First, and you've
14 heard this before, market-based approaches have
15 shown to be effective in reducing air pollution at a
16 regional level. Second, analysis shows that carbon
17 emissions from power plants in RGGI states have
18 fallen 90 percent faster than in the rest of the
19 country.

20 Third, regional optimization. RGGI is
21 in place in Delaware, Maryland, New York, and more
22 recently in New Jersey and Virginia. Pennsylvania
23 will benefit and strengthen the regional solution
24 like what we've seen in other interstate cooperative
25 efforts.

1 And finally, the benefit cost of RGGI
2 has been positive for all states that have joined
3 RGGI. The Analysis Group report which was cited
4 earlier estimated that the net present value of RGGI
5 between 2015 and 2017 to be over a billion dollars.
6 Pennsylvania citizens deserve a share of these type
7 of benefits.

8 For these reasons and more, I ask the
9 Department of Environmental Protection to move
10 Pennsylvania forward on clean energy by entering the
11 Commonwealth into RGGI.

12 With that, I'd like to thank you for
13 your time and consideration, and I yield the
14 remainder back to the group. Have a good evening.

15 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Scott.

16 Next, we have number 47, Steven Clark.

17 MR. CLARK: Thank you for this
18 opportunity. I'd like to second the preceding
19 speaker's emphasis on fairness.

20 My name is Steve Clark. I'm an
21 electrical engineer from Haverford Township, which
22 is right outside of Philadelphia. I'm speaking in
23 support of RGGI rulemaking, unaffiliated with any
24 organization.

25 I have four children and am testifying

1 on behalf of them. When they were younger, I was
2 their Cub Scout pack leader and have many treasured
3 memories camping with cubs and parents in
4 Pennsylvania's natural beauty.

5 One of scouting's essentials is leave
6 no trace. In short, leave the world the same or in
7 better condition. The smallest piece of trash is
8 removed before we leave to honor those who will come
9 next.

10 But what if a group went camping and
11 completely trashed the site for thousands of years
12 to come? This strikes us as horrific, yet this is
13 the current business as usual outcome of burning
14 fossil fuels.

15 Today's Pennsylvania electric grid is
16 the opposite of leave no trace. Our grid is biased
17 to burning fossil fuels which emit heat trapping CO2
18 which remains in the atmosphere for thousands of
19 years, long after the coal or gas planet has closed.

20 The price of electricity for fossil
21 fuel plants is currently artificially low since it
22 doesn't include these, quote, unquote, hidden costs
23 to occur in future generations. This is
24 fundamentally unfair. The operators of these plants
25 get to claim the profits now yet everybody else pays

1 the price of heat trapping CO2, health risks from
2 NOx, O_x, and particulates now and into the distant
3 future.

4 For basic fairness, the price of this
5 electricity needs to have a portion of these
6 individual social costs incorporated. This would
7 produce a more accurate pricing when comparing to
8 clean electricity sources. RGGI will be an
9 important first step for Pennsylvania joining
10 neighboring states and climate leadership for the
11 following four reasons.

12 Currently, Pennsylvania electricity
13 plants emit almost as much CO2 as plants from the
14 other nine RGGI states combined. That doesn't
15 include Virginia. I think Virginia is a recent
16 joining.

17 Second, electricity generation is the
18 second largest source of CO2 emissions in PA. If
19 Pennsylvania were a country, it currently emits more
20 CO2 than 172 of the 194 signatories of the Paris
21 Climate Accordance.

22 And finally, Pennsylvania's aging
23 nuclear plants are facing price pressure from
24 natural gas plants. Replacing nuclear plants with
25 artificially cheap natural gas will lock in new

1 massive CO2 sources for decades.

2 This would be catastrophic and
3 analogous to the hypothetical campers trafficking
4 those sites for the next 1,000 years. The cost of
5 electricity must reflect the social cost of carbon.
6 In short, I support RGGI for these reasons of basic
7 economic fairness and a scout's desire to leave no
8 trace for our children and their children.

9 I yield my remaining time. Thank you.

10 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Steven.

11 Next, we have number 48, Charmaine
12 Butler. Charmaine are you there?

13 MS. BUTLER: Yes, I'm here.

14 MS. SHIRLEY: Okay. You can begin.

15 MS. BUTLER: Okay. Thanks.

16 Good evening, everyone. My name is
17 Charmaine Butler. Charmaine is spelled
18 C-H-A-R-M-A-I-N-E, last name Butler, B-U-T-L-E-R,
19 and I'm a resident of Upper Darby Township,
20 Pennsylvania. I'm a wife and a mother of two adult
21 children and a grandmother of two grandchildren ages
22 12 and 8.

23 Thank you for the opportunity to speak
24 to you today at this hearing. My testimony is in
25 further support as to why the Commonwealth of

1 Pennsylvania should join the Regional Greenhouse Gas
2 Initiative known as RGGI.

3 Here's what we know. The climate is
4 changing in Pennsylvania and across the United
5 States because of greenhouse gas emission of fossil
6 fuels like coal, natural gas, and oil.

7 Temperatures in Pennsylvania are
8 projected to increase by 4.5 degrees by 2050. Power
9 outages from extreme storms across Pennsylvania hit
10 a record high in 2019, disturbing electricity
11 servers of nearly 2 million families and benefits.

12 While we wait for Pennsylvania to make
13 a decision to joint RGGI or not, please let us take
14 a moment to re-imagine RGGI in Pennsylvania.

15 I cannot talk about RGGI until I bring
16 attention to environmental racism. Now, I know the
17 topic of racism makes --- makes some of you
18 uncomfortable. So hopefully after my testimony, you
19 will be at ease.

20 Environmental racism is not just a
21 problem but America's problem. Consequently, here's
22 where the line starts to blur when we do not view
23 the connection between racism and environmental
24 racism.

25 Environmental racism refers to the way

1 in which minority group neighborhoods are burdened
2 with a disproportionate number of hazards and
3 includes a toxic waste facility, garbage dumps, and
4 other sources of environmental pollution and foul
5 odor that lowers the quality of life.

6 The statistics on environmental racism
7 are shocking. Robert Bullard (phonetic), a
8 sociologist, conducted a 25-year comparison study
9 about African-Americans' lives. Environmentally
10 unsound housing, schools with asbestos problems,
11 facilities and playgrounds with lead paint, and race
12 to be more important than social economics status is
13 in particular the location of the nation's
14 commercials hazardous waste product.

15 Sociologists along with the project
16 are examining how environmental racism is addressed
17 in the long-term cleanup of the environmental cost,
18 the environment issue that caused Hurricane Katrina.

19 RGGI has proven to be a successful in
20 the ten other states by cutting climate pollution by
21 a third and raising nearly \$3 billion to invest in
22 clean energy and other purposes. Investment in
23 energy efficiency for revenue created by RGGI can
24 reduce electric bills.

25 In the states already participating in

1 RGGI, investments under the program had helped save
2 consumers more than a billion dollars on their ---
3 on their electric bill. This is why Pennsylvania
4 must plan for the transition that already happened
5 and to prepare Pennsylvania workers for the energy
6 jobs of the future.

7 A portion of the proceeds can be used
8 to help workers in communities who will be affected
9 by the ongoing transition of energy market away from
10 coal and natural gas. If Pennsylvania decides to
11 join RGGI, it will provide multiple benefits to the
12 citizens of Pennsylvania.

13 Reports conducted by the DEP estimate
14 that Pennsylvania carbon pollution will cut --- will
15 be cut by 21 percent or 180 tons from 2022 to 2030.

16 This is equal to taking more than 4 million cars
17 off the road.

18 I'm here to put --- finally, we are
19 seeing the effects of climate change locally,
20 nationally, and globally.

21 Thank you for your time.

22 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Charmaine.

23 Next, we have number 49, Teresa
24 Caruthers.

25 MS. CARUTHERS: Hello. Can you hear

1 me?

2 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes. You can start,
3 Teresa.

4 MS. CARUTHERS: Thank you.

5 My name is Teresa Caruthers
6 T-E-R-E-S-A, Caruthers C-A-R-U-T-H-E-R-S. I'm from
7 Ephrata, Pennsylvania.

8 I'm a nurse practitioner, a nurse and
9 industrial hygienist. I've spent most of my career
10 in public health environments protecting
11 Pennsylvanians from Covid-19 and addressing the
12 systemic racial injustices that plague our
13 communities must be the top priorities of our
14 elected officials right now.

15 However, its critical lawmakers don't
16 lose sight of our escalating threats to our health
17 and economy, including the pollution that affects
18 the safety and well-being of our families and
19 communities.

20 In fact, this pandemic has made the
21 urgency of proactive science-based policy solutions
22 all the more evident. RGGI is the first regional
23 market-based carbon trading program in the U.S.
24 Joining RGGI is an important first step for PA, the
25 Northeast Region, the U.S., and the planet.

1 Pennsylvania is the fourth or fifth
2 dirtiest power sector in the nation and the power
3 plants operating in Pennsylvania emit more carbon
4 pollution than all the other power plants in the ten
5 northeastern states already in RGGI.

6 A binding declining limit of carbon
7 pollution is a necessary element of any strategy to
8 address this problem. Major Pennsylvania power
9 companies including Exelon and First Energy
10 applauded Governor Wolf's executive order. The
11 Pennsylvania Chamber of Commerce noted that climate
12 change is real and that the business community needs
13 to be at a table to discuss solutions.

14 In addition, the financial community
15 must be at the table to include projections of
16 financial risk calculations for investment and
17 various energy projects.

18 The time for action is now. It is
19 becoming increasingly urgent to address climate
20 change. That means it is critical for Pennsylvania
21 to move forward without delay and put in place an
22 ambitious program to secure carbon pollution
23 reductions and lock in Pennsylvania health benefits
24 at the lowest cost.

25 ABT associates conducted one of the

1 first studies to investigate public health benefits
2 of RGGI. And they found that RGGI significantly
3 reduced air pollution from fossil fuel plants,
4 improving the health of people of the northeast.

5 Many other people have discussed the
6 statistics of 300 to 830 lives saved, more than
7 8,200 asthma attacks avoided, 39,000 lost work days
8 avoided, \$5.7 billion in health savings and other
9 benefits. The report provides rigorous independent
10 evidence that RGGI has been an economic and
11 environmental success with direct benefits to human
12 health and to state's economies.

13 A recent study also indicated, as
14 somebody else pointed out, that the RGGI benefits
15 children's health. A study was conducted and it
16 found that 537 asthma cases avoided, 112 pre-term
17 deaths --- pre-term births avoided, 98 cases of
18 autism spectrum disorder avoided, 56 cases of low
19 birth weight avoided.

20 The estimated savings ranged from \$191
21 to \$350 million. European investigators from the
22 World Resource Institute investigated RGGI early on
23 in 2009 and learned that RGGI provides a powerful
24 example of how simple things can make a real
25 difference by generating emissions reductions,

1 training and new jobs and most importantly political
2 confidence in action.

3 RGGI's approach has quietly provided a
4 pilot for the rest of the U.S. by learning lessons
5 from Europe and improving on the policies adopted
6 there. RGGI generated close to a half a billion
7 dollars in its first year for investment in energy
8 efficiency, clean energy programs, and new jobs.

9 One thought that came to mind as
10 people were talking about nuclear, etcetera, there
11 is a problem in generating heat in high
12 temperatures, a problem of cooling water evolves.
13 Generating power needs is a water-intensive process.
14 And you can't just simply go plug water back into
15 the environment. So that's a problem there.

16 But anyway, I urge RGGI be adopted by
17 Pennsylvania as soon as possible.

18 Thank you.

19 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Teresa.

20 Next, we have number 50, Annie
21 Guadagnino.

22 MS. GUADAGNINO: Hi, yes. This is
23 Annie Guadagnino. Annie, A-N-N-I-E, Guadagnino
24 G-U-A-D-A-G-N-I-N-O. Good evening.

25 Thank you for the opportunity to give

1 public comment today. I'm a lifelong resident of
2 Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, and I've decided to
3 testify today to express my concern about the
4 consequences of environmental pollution in
5 Pennsylvania and urge the DEP and EQB to enact the
6 rules necessary to join the Regional Greenhouse Gas
7 Initiative to help better protect our environment
8 and our health.

9 We have known for decades that the
10 emissions of greenhouse gases pollute our
11 environment and negatively impact our health and
12 safety. Greenhouse gas combustion causes
13 particulate pollution and climate change, both of
14 which we are already --- are already harming our
15 quality of life in Pennsylvania and threaten to
16 damage our well-being even more in the future.

17 Because of climate change, water
18 levels are rising across the globe. When PA rivers
19 rise and overflow, they flood the surrounding land
20 and lead to runoff contamination of drinking water
21 sources. The burning of fossil fuels also creates
22 airborne particle pollution which contributes to a
23 variety of heart and lung diseases.

24 Additionally, increases in temperature
25 cause an increase in smog, made from the combustion

1 of fossil fuels that can penetrate the blood stream
2 and lungs and worsen conditions such as allergies,
3 asthma and bronchitis.

4 Reducing Pennsylvania's emissions of
5 greenhouse gases would be a large step towards
6 cleaning up our air and water. The Regional
7 Greenhouse Gas Initiative will help Pennsylvania
8 reduce emissions by capping the amount of carbon
9 pollution in our region and subsequently other
10 harmful pollutants emitted alongside carbon during
11 fossil fuel combustion and by facilitating the
12 decline in overall carbon pollution over the next
13 decade, which we need in order to solve climate
14 change.

15 As a resident of Pittsburgh, I know
16 well the story of Pittsburgh's transformation from a
17 coal and steel city to a cleaned up haven for health
18 care innovation and prosperity. While we can and
19 should take pride in the progress we've made in the
20 past 100 years, it doesn't erase the harsh facts
21 that Pittsburgh still has some of the worst air
22 quality in the country and that our polluted
23 environment is still making us sick.

24 Pennsylvanians deserve clean air and
25 water. It is a goal of the Department of

1 Environmental Protection's mission to provide for
2 the health and safety of its citizens through a
3 cleaner environment. And so I ask the DEP and EQB
4 to work swiftly to enact the proposed greenhouse gas
5 initiative rules to curb the emission of harmful
6 pollutants and help slow the tide of climate change.

7 Thank you.

8 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Annie.

9 Next up, we have number 52, Marc
10 Karasek.

11 Do we have Mark on the line?

12 MR. KARASEK: Hi.

13 MS. SHIRLEY: Is that Marc?

14 MR. KARASEK: Yes. Can you hear me?

15 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes.

16 MR. KARASEK: Hi. My name is Marc
17 Karasek. You've got my name spelled correctly. I'm
18 a 34-year-old mechanical engineer. I live with my
19 wife and young son in Media, Pennsylvania in
20 Delaware County.

21 While I am concerned about climate
22 change, I am frustrated by the federal and PA
23 government's inaction on climate change, but I'm
24 personally stressed by this alarming future for both
25 my own family and our entire civilization.

1 I, therefore, want to support the
2 subject proposal and I want to see Pennsylvania join
3 the RGGI. That said, I'm excited about green
4 energy. I --- I read news articles about solar
5 panels and wind power and electric cars and all
6 these new green technologies that are coming out.
7 There's money to be made in cleaning up our
8 environment.

9 I personally have rooftop solar
10 panels. I make money with them. I know that I
11 provide clean energy into the grid and I know that I
12 reduce heat load on the grid. My panels come with
13 story, though. When I first proposed them in 2016,
14 they were --- my proposal was rejected by PECO, the
15 energy company, due to their outdated
16 infrastructure.

17 They had a bunch of things that they
18 wanted me to pay for that were outrageously
19 expensive, really due to their own failure to invest
20 in deficiency. I pointed out a house up the street;
21 hey, this house has solar panels on it. And they
22 said, well, they wouldn't get it if they applied
23 today.

24 This left me really disappointed and
25 angry and really being penalized for PECO's failure

1 to look forward.

2 I have filed a formal complaint with
3 the Pennsylvania Utility Commission due to a 2018
4 storm that knocked down some power lines and due to
5 my own pointing out the failure to meet their own
6 voltage requirements, I ended up with solar panels.

7 But still, my neighbors can't do that.
8 They can't get rooftop solar because we lack the
9 infrastructure in our area. So what gives PECO the
10 incentive to do this? Well, we have to make it a
11 priority for them to use clean energy and that's one
12 of the things that the RGGI would do.

13 We have to make it a --- a negative
14 for them to continue using their sources of dirty
15 energy. I also see lots of things about off-shore
16 wind. This is a strong resource that the Northeast
17 United States has. It's time to make investments in
18 this natural resource and the --- our region is
19 somewhere where we can make those investments.

20 How do we get the electric companies
21 to do this? We have to make it cost money to use
22 what we are using. We have to make it a good
23 investment for them.

24 The U.S. government also needs a nudge
25 from those companies to open up permitting for

1 offshore wind. I mentioned that I'm a mechanical
2 engineer. I'd love to work on sustainable energy
3 products but I also want to say here in Southeast
4 Pennsylvania. So we have to encourage businesses
5 that have sustainable products to come here.

6 I want my four-year-old son to grow up
7 not going to a public school breathing in diesel
8 exhaust but I want him to ride in a clean energy
9 powered electric bus. This is achievable. We just
10 need to help with the investments. We need to
11 encourage our companies to do this.

12 I want to see a clean energy future.
13 I put in my personal time, energy and thought into
14 that future and I want to see Pennsylvania do the
15 same.

16 So let me reiterate. I am concerned
17 about climate change and I support the subject
18 proposal. Thank you, all of you, and to the DEP for
19 listening to my comments.

20 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Marc.

21 Next, we have number 53, Jaret
22 Gibbons.

23 Do we have Jaret on?

24 MR. GIBBONS: Hi, Jess. Can you hear
25 me?

1 MS. SHIRLEY: Yes, I can. You can go
2 ahead.

3 MR. GIBBONS: Thank you.

4 My name is Jaret Gibbons, J-A-R-E-T
5 G-I-B-B-O-N-S from Elwood City, Pennsylvania.

6 I'm a former democratic state
7 representative and currently executive director of
8 the Appalachian Region Independent Power Producers
9 Association or ARIPPA which is the tree association
10 for the mine land reclamation to energy industry in
11 Pennsylvania and West Virginia.

12 The industry in Pennsylvania is
13 currently comprised of ten facilities that reclaim
14 polluting waste coal piles and remediate mining
15 affected land generally located on abandoned mine
16 land or AML sights.

17 This is down from 14 reclamation
18 plants only two years ago. My comments tonight will
19 focus on the waste coal set aside in this proposed
20 rule.

21 As the Commonwealth's energy
22 priorities continue to shift away from traditional
23 fossil fuel sources, we must deal with the legacy of
24 historic mining operations that powered our country
25 during the previous century. Coal mining companies

1 continue to struggle and close, many in bankruptcy,
2 while funds available for reclamation regularly
3 prove insufficient to adequately reclaim former
4 mining sights.

5 The mining reclamation to energy
6 industry is a market-based alternative energy
7 solution for this problem that, if preserved, could
8 save the state over \$5 billion dollars in
9 environmental remediation costs.

10 Pennsylvania has at least 220 million
11 tons of polluting waste coal located on more than
12 770 identified sites covering 8,300 acres. Since
13 the late 1980s, this industry has reclaimed at least
14 230 million tons of waste coal and remediated over
15 7,200 acres of land, thereby improving more than
16 1,200 miles of Pennsylvania waterways.

17 These plants provide 37 million
18 dollars per year in environmental and public use
19 benefits while saving the state up to \$257 million
20 dollars annually in avoided environmental cleanup
21 costs according to a 2019 study by Egan-Salt
22 (phonetic) Solutions.

23 These facilities and the AML
24 reclamation work they perform are often in low
25 income rural environmental justice areas of

1 Pennsylvania that have been disproportionately
2 impacted by historic mining operations and the
3 decline of industry throughout Northeastern and
4 Western Pennsylvania.

5 The acid mine water runoff from these
6 areas flow downstream to pollute water sources for
7 major population centers in the Delaware,
8 Susquehanna and Ohio River Basins in the Chesapeake
9 Bay. Without these plants, most of these polluting
10 wasteful piles will not be removed due to limited
11 alternative AML reclamation processes and funding.

12 We thank the Department of
13 Environmental Protection and the Wolf administration
14 for their support of this industry over the years.
15 In the current proposed CO2 budget trading
16 rulemaking, they have fittingly taken into account
17 the positive environmental benefits of this industry
18 by providing a waste coal set-aside account in an
19 effort to recognize the tangible environmental
20 improvements that this industry provides to land,
21 air, and water from AML reclamation.

22 We appreciate the changes already made
23 during the process of developing this rule to extend
24 the look-back period for legacy emissions
25 considering recent market trends and provide greater

1 regulatory certainty to individual plants.

2 While additional work still needs to
3 be done, ARIPPA looks forward to continuing our
4 partnership with the Department moving forward to
5 ensure our mutual goal that this industry can be
6 health harmless through this rulemaking process.

7 An adequate set-aside will help these
8 plants continue to operate and thus clean up the
9 environment. These small, mostly family-owned
10 independent reclamation plants operate at extremely
11 thin margins due to the high cost of remediating
12 waste coal piles.

13 As market-based providers of
14 electricity, they would not be able to economically
15 continue their positive environmental work if
16 subject to the proposed CO2 budge training program.
17 It is in all of our best interest that the vital
18 environmental remediation work performed by these
19 facilities for the Commonwealth and its residents
20 continues unabated.

21 Thank you for your time.

22 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Jaret.

23 Next, we have number 54, Susan Loucks.

24 MS. LOUCKS: Hi.

25 I want to speak first on, I think

1 speaker 39; I think her name was Barbara. I've been
2 on this call since the beginning. And I expected it
3 to be absolutely boring. It has not been.

4 This has been a tough year for
5 democracy. This is a far from perfect format and as
6 it turns out, all 50 of the speakers that have all
7 spoken before me, we've all been in agreement, which
8 makes it a little bit perhaps less like democracy at
9 work.

10 But listening to 50 people who care
11 enough to research and prepare remarks, share their
12 perspectives and their stories, I'm really humbled
13 by all of you and I --- and certainly the panel,
14 when they see this --- I --- I give you my props.
15 It's been --- it felt really good for me to be here
16 today, so let me start off with that.

17 Because honestly, like I said, a lot
18 of you took the time --- anyway, I live in
19 Pittsburgh. We've gotten mentioned by the American
20 Lung Association for the last two years. I've been
21 here for about six years. But I lived in
22 Massachusetts from 2000 until the end of 2012. I
23 came on this call thinking I was going to be the
24 Massachusetts rep, but there were a few at the
25 beginning there, so.

1 So I come with a Massachusetts
2 perspective to this. So I have a Master's degree in
3 natural resources, which I'm not using a lot, but I
4 do have that background. And for many of the 12
5 years that I was in Massachusetts, I was working in
6 some sort of environmental-related field, including
7 non-profits that worked on market transformation
8 with utility companies across the region.

9 Of course that was the 12 years when
10 RGGI was ramping up in Massachusetts and beginning
11 implementation. It was something that people were
12 definitely talking about in the circles I was in.
13 And the lessons we have from Massachusetts certainly
14 give me high hopes for the effect it might have in
15 Pennsylvania.

16 Now, a couple of things. You know,
17 Pennsylvania feels real different to me from
18 Massachusetts. And part of it is because
19 Massachusetts does not have an industry that is so
20 deeply embedded in fossil fuels. And that's a, you
21 know, just part of Pennsylvania's history for better
22 or worse.

23 But decoupling this conversation on
24 economy and pollution would be so important for
25 Pennsylvania. And that is what RGGI does, right?

1 It lets you see that it is possible to have economic
2 growth that's not dependent on increased emissions.
3 Of course, we're just down from where the plastics
4 plant is coming in Beaver County and I know this
5 isn't related to that but if we could decouple that
6 conversation and enable other conversations to
7 happen in the state, which are really important and
8 for us to bring these questions to everybody.

9 So that's one really great thing that
10 I think RGGI can do for us. Again, as mentioned
11 before, Massachusetts set some global warming goals
12 back in 2008. The targets it set would be really
13 hard to achieve without RGGI. But as a result of
14 its participation in RGGI, it can kind of like
15 confidently step into those goals and talk about
16 even more what is possible.

17 You know, Pennsylvania only set their
18 goals in 2018. So I think that the goals that we
19 set here in this state are going to be very hard to
20 meet without some sort of larger scale systems
21 change. I think that RGGI is a tool that can, as
22 Massachusetts can, allow us to demonstrate success
23 and commitment to what we set and even expand on
24 that vision.

25 And someone else mentioned this as

1 well that, you know, we've certainly seen in the
2 time since 2000 that, you know, federal
3 administration goals and ambitions have shown the
4 states are really becoming the players who can lead
5 this forward. This compact of regional states
6 working together is a really powerful tool that can
7 help the change much even when we can't count on
8 larger systems to be responsive to the dangers of
9 climate change that so many people have talked
10 about.

11 I would mention I think that's it's
12 the really heavy punch that consumers have had ---
13 in the RGGI region have had lower electrical costs
14 as a result of the RGGI. Basically, when you look
15 at the RGGI map, there's, you know, New Jersey has
16 reconsidered and is coming back in as mentioned,
17 Virginia is coming back on board. There's this
18 giant gap. It's an embarrassment. It needs to jump
19 in. I'm all for Pennsylvania joining RGGI like all
20 of my other comrades here on this call, and I yield
21 the rest of my time.

22 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Susan.

23 Next, we have number 56, Richard
24 Dillon. Do we have Richard on the line?

25 MR. JAGIELA: Not from what I can see.

1 MS. SHIRLEY: All right.

2 Richard, if you are on the line, let
3 us know.

4 Number 57, Kathy Pollard.

5 Do we have Kathy?

6 MR. JAGIELA: She is on the line and
7 unmuted.

8 MS. SHIRLEY: Okay.

9 Kathy, we currently have you unmuted
10 on our end. Why don't we go to the next speaker and
11 you can work with Darek about what might be going
12 on, why we can't hear you?

13 But do we have number 58, Barbara
14 Arrindell on the line?

15 MR. JAGIELA: We do not.

16 MS. SHIRLEY: Okay. No Barbara.

17 What about number 59, Andrea Strout?

18 MS. STROUT: Speaking.

19 MS. SHIRLEY: Oh hi, Andrea. I'm
20 going to start your timer. You can go ahead.

21 MS. STROUT: Okay.

22 Well, good evening everyone. My name
23 is Andrea Strout, A-N-D-R-E-A S-T-R-O-U-T, and I
24 live in Buckingham, Pennsylvania.

25 I'm testifying as a private citizen in

1 favor, strongly in favor of Pennsylvania's
2 participation in RGGI. But it's actually my
3 husband's story that I'd like to tell.

4 Dan was born in Fayette County,
5 Pennsylvania, coal country. Coal was the family
6 business in fact. His parents met at the company
7 store. Much of his family lived in company housing.

8 Dan's most vivid childhood memories
9 are of the ash from beehive ovens that permanently
10 blanketed houses, cars, and trees and of playing in
11 red dog AKA slate dunks with his siblings.

12 My husband is not the testifying type
13 which is why I'm telling his story. But a photo
14 from 2017 showing the President surrounded by miners
15 as he signed the executive order that repealed the
16 clean power plants promising that it would bring
17 back coal, motivated him to write a letter to the
18 editor of our local paper.

19 Dan felt it was important to share his
20 perspective with others, especially those whose
21 lives, incomes and identities going back many
22 generations revolved around coal.

23 I'd like to share with you just a
24 couple of excerpts from that letter which ran in the
25 Bucks County Herald in April of 2017.

1 "Six of my uncles and both
2 grandfathers went down into the mine. My ancestors
3 dug coal in England and Wales. I became a teacher
4 and my five brothers and sisters likewise pursued
5 other lines of work.

6 We've had the usual ups and downs but
7 we have generally done well. So what I want to tell
8 the anxious miners in the March 28 photo with
9 President Trump is this. There is life after coal."

10 The transition to a fossil free future
11 won't be easy. But with thoughtful planning, it can
12 be more equitable and less painful than as previous
13 such hinge moments.

14 In fact, we're already well into that
15 transition. It's wildly past time that we were.
16 The true cost of our reliance on extracted fuel
17 isn't the price of a barrel of oil, a short ton of
18 coal, or a cubic foot of natural gas. It's the
19 billions upon billions needed to mitigate, repair,
20 rebuild, remediate, treat and otherwise offset the
21 effects of increased droughts, wildfires, algae
22 blooms, unsafe drinking water, sea level rise and
23 violent storms.

24 For the sake of all who share this
25 planet, let's slap a real price tag on carbon

1 finally.

2 Thank you.

3 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Andrea.

4 Next up, we have number 60, Karla
5 McNamara.

6 Do we have Karla on the line?

7 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see Karla on
8 the line.

9 MS. SHIRLEY: Okay. Karla, if you are
10 on the line, let us know.

11 Darek, were we able to get Kathy
12 Pollard to call in or we're still working on that
13 one?

14 MR. JAGIELA: We're working on it.
15 She should be ready after the next person.

16 MS. SHIRLEY: All right.

17 Let's go --- do we have number 61,
18 Ayres Freitas?

19 MR. FREITAS: Yes, I am here.

20 MS. SHIRLEY: Okay. You can begin.

21 MR. FREITAS: Very good.

22 My name is Ayres Freitas, A-Y-R-E-S
23 F-R-E-I-T-A-S, from Pittsburgh.

24 I'm a professor of physics at the
25 University of Pittsburgh but tonight I'm not

1 testifying on behalf of the University but as a
2 private resident.

3 I support the proposed rule of the
4 Environmental Quality Board to regulate CO2
5 emissions and join the RGGI program. Many of the
6 previous testifiers have already expounded the
7 scientific, economic, and health reasons calling for
8 this measure and I do not wish to repeat any of
9 them.

10 Let me only reiterate that according
11 to data from NOAA, the year 2020 continues the trend
12 of being significantly more than 1 degree Fahrenheit
13 warmer and also winter on average in Western PA,
14 even though it may be dry compared to 2018 and 2019.

15 In the following, however, I would
16 like to get some perspective of several objections
17 against the proposed rule that have been expressed.

18 For instance, there is understandable concern that
19 it may lead to loss of jobs in the natural gas
20 sector.

21 However, existing gas facilities and
22 power plants will be able to continue operating
23 under RGGI for many years. The most immediate
24 impact of the cap-and-trade deal will be our plans
25 for future power generating facilities.

1 Currently, 93 percent of new
2 electricity generating capacity under construction
3 in Pennsylvania is based on natural gas, according
4 to the PA Public Utility Commission. Continuing
5 along this trajectory will make Pennsylvania
6 dependent on a single source of power with widely
7 fluctuating prices. And it will lock in future CO2
8 and methane emissions and other environmental
9 hazards.

10 If we continue to invest in fossil
11 fuel infrastructure, any action by future
12 governments to curb climate and air pollution will
13 need to be much more drastic and harmful to the
14 state economy.

15 Instead, by joining RGGI now, the
16 state provides the framework for predictable long-
17 term planning by energy and utility companies. It
18 supports investment in renewable energy and energy
19 efficiency industries which provide good and stable
20 jobs for Pennsylvanians.

21 The E2 business group reports that
22 employment in green energy in Pennsylvania has gone
23 from 60 percent to more than 90 thousand from 2014
24 to 2018. At the same time, gas industry jobs are
25 very unreliable. Jobs in natural gas extraction

1 have dropped by more than 60 percent between 2011
2 and 2016, according to the PA Independent Fiscal
3 Office, not because of environmental regulation but
4 simply due to the failed productivity of the fossil
5 fuel market.

6 By regulating CO2 emissions to RGGI,
7 the state can do its part to limit the worst effects
8 of climate change while supporting stable job growth
9 in renewable energy. Two independent polls
10 conducted by Yale University and by climate experts
11 show that at least 70 percent of Pennsylvanians
12 support regulations to reduce CO2 emissions,
13 including both majorities of Democrats and
14 Republicans.

15 Now it would be relevant to implement
16 such measures to legislation, but leaders of the
17 Pennsylvania Legislature have decided to abdicate
18 their responsibility and to not even allow any
19 climate change related bills to get out of Committee
20 and come to a vote.

21 Therefore, the state administration
22 must step in to fill this void. So I strongly
23 support the proposed rule.

24 Thank you.

25 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you.

1 Next, I'm told that we have Kathy
2 Pollard on the line now.

3 Kathy, are you able to ---

4 MS. POLLARD: Hi, folks.

5 MS. SHIRLEY: Hi. We can hear you.
6 Thank you for being so flexible.

7 MS. POLLARD: Oh, thank you. Thank
8 you and to all the participants for your dedication
9 and involvement. I really appreciate all of you.
10 And thank you for having me at this important
11 hearing.

12 I'm particularly excited to be
13 speaking here in support of a solution to curb
14 climate change, a regional solution, one that my
15 state can contribute to and one that has already
16 proven successful in so many other states in our
17 region. And Pennsylvania can provide a meaningful
18 addition too.

19 A bit about me. I'm a nutrition
20 educator and researcher, specializing in sustainable
21 nutrition, plant-based nutrition in particular. I
22 teach nutrition for the University of New England
23 and I'm on staff of the American College of
24 Lifestyle Medicine as a researcher and in education
25 design. I write about how food habits affect

1 climate change.

2 And that food affecting climate change
3 is actually good news. It gives us an opportunity
4 to make meaningful change towards a healthier
5 climate as well as affect our personal health.

6 Through my work, I see such
7 interconnections of that or habits in health and I
8 see how the impact of environmental pollution can be
9 on our health. It's all interconnected. Our
10 personal health, our well-being, and the environment
11 in which we live.

12 We can do the same with pollution
13 which affects millions of people just in our state
14 alone, through asthma and respiratory illnesses and
15 skin conditions and even chronic diseases like
16 cardiovascular disease. Because air pollution
17 facilitates average lower development progression,
18 other people have been pointing out these health
19 effects just tonight on this --- on these calls.

20 Pollution exacerbates any existing
21 respiratory weaknesses including symptoms of the
22 viruses like Covid-19 and the common flu. We can
23 reduce this and reduce deaths through RGGI that
24 we're talking about today, as other states have
25 done.

1 It will improve the quality of life
2 for everyone in our cities and it is where we can
3 start to make the change that we are now forced to
4 face. RGGI simply is a powerful tool at our finger
5 tips to kick start meaningful change. Now nobody
6 wants to change. It's hard. Personally,
7 structurally, we've been hearing about the affected
8 jobs but we have no choice. We must act. And this
9 is an easy step to take towards controlling the
10 worst effects of climate change.

11 We can only succeed through
12 cooperation and we had better get used to that.
13 RGGI is a baby step. There are bigger steps
14 available to us, including federal initiatives
15 working their way through Congress, most notably
16 HR763, the Energy Innovation and Carbon Dividend
17 Act, a bipartisan initiative that offers comfortable
18 and immediate market-based planned solutions to fund
19 our transformation to clean energy without that
20 taxation and promising good jobs to be created.

21 We know from science that we must take
22 steps now to avoid the worst. We are already living
23 through extreme weather events, droughts, heat
24 waves, just to name some of the effects of global
25 warming and for all those working outside, consider

1 their exposure to heat stress. All the food we eat
2 depends on these people, farmers in our state and
3 around the world. Not to mention sea level rise
4 encroaching on our coastal cities. Even
5 Philadelphia is in the way of rising waters, which
6 was mentioned earlier. We could have rising waters
7 up to 19 inches around Philly by 2050.

8 This is why we must start acting now.
9 We can't ignore the changes, even if we are more
10 comfortable here in Pennsylvania than most. The
11 ITCP, the world's foremost body of climate science
12 has a clear message for us all: to avoid
13 catastrophe, we must act now to avoid a rise beyond
14 1.5 Celsius. And we are already close.

15 We have increased warming over a
16 degree just the past --- since the Industrial
17 Revolution and we can't rise any further. The good
18 news is that changing infrastructure and making
19 industry responsible for carbon emissions will usher
20 in healthier --- a healthier economy. It will
21 create jobs. It will create opportunities to
22 redefine our infrastructure.

23 For all these reasons, health, quality
24 of life, job opportunity and securing a livable
25 future for those generations behind us, I urge the

1 PA Environmental Quality Board to adopt RGGI.

2 And I very much thank you for this
3 opportunity.

4 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Kathy.

5 Next, we have number 62, Dean
6 VanTassel. Do we have Dean on the line?

7 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see Dean on the
8 line.

9 MS. SHIRLEY: Okay.

10 Dean, if you are on the line, please
11 let us know.

12 Next up, we have number 63, Ella
13 Graban.

14 MS. GRABAN: Hello.

15 I'd first like to say thank you for
16 this opportunity to voice my opinion. My name is
17 Ella Graban. I'm a sophomore in high school and a
18 resident of Doylestown, Pennsylvania. I'm
19 testifying as a private citizen and I'm here to give
20 my full support for Pennsylvania to put a limit on
21 greenhouse gas emissions.

22 I'm in favor of the proposed rule in
23 Pennsylvania joining the RGGI. It is time to move
24 forward towards clean energy and leave fossil fuels
25 behind us.

1 Like the other states in the northeast
2 who have joined the RGGI, New England, Delaware,
3 Maryland, Connecticut and more; these states have
4 had tremendous success with this program which is
5 one of the reasons Pennsylvania should join it.

6 The fact cutting carbon emissions
7 down, it has helped homeowners and other
8 Pennsylvanians receive more efficient energy, which
9 in return, saves them money. Also, RGGI has created
10 thousands of new jobs and added \$4.3 billion in
11 economic value to the area where it has been
12 implemented.

13 This is highly beneficial to all and
14 it is only logical that Pennsylvania join this
15 initiative.

16 Meanwhile, climate change is the
17 biggest existential threat of the human race and it
18 is terrifying to already see the effects of climate
19 change happening. There were and still are
20 countless destructive wildfires around the world in
21 Australia, the United States, the Arctic, the Amazon
22 and more.

23 Also, there has been more frequent and
24 stronger hurricanes hitting the United States. In
25 fact, 2020 is the sixth consecutive year in which

1 the U.S. has experienced ten or more billion dollar
2 weather and climate-related disasters. These
3 disasters and their effects will only get worse and
4 worse if the world does not do something about it
5 now.

6 We are all inhabitants of this planet
7 and climate change will affect all of us but not
8 equally. It is selfish and immoral for our leaders
9 to continually ignore the threat that is the climate
10 crisis. Because at the end of the day, those that
11 are wealthy can practically avoid the effects of
12 climate change.

13 Also, it is the wealthy and the big
14 corporations who are responsible for the majority of
15 emissions and we must hold them accountable. If
16 their homes get flooded by the rising waters, they
17 will be able to recover. Low income communities
18 will not.

19 Underprivileged people have and will
20 continue to be proportionately harmed by fossil
21 fuels, air and water pollution which cause countless
22 health issues and climate change.

23 RGGI will bring about a better quality
24 of life and well-being for Pennsylvania. By cutting
25 down on emissions and pollutants, RGGI has shown

1 that it has improved the physical health of people
2 in each area it has been carried out in.
3 Additionally, I believe Pennsylvania joining RGGI
4 will improve mental health as well.

5 I speak for many young people when I
6 say that I spent an exceptional amount of my time
7 worrying about climate change. It is a major source
8 of anxiety to think about, but we are on the brink
9 of an astronomical disaster. We are running out of
10 time to act and our country is simply not doing
11 enough right now.

12 Influencing RGGI in Pennsylvania would
13 be an incredible and necessary step in the right
14 direction and will create hope for Americans. RGGI
15 will bring prosperity and opportunity, benefiting
16 both the economy and the planet. We must combat
17 climate change together for the survival of our
18 people and nature and of our planet.

19 The time to act is now. It's the only
20 option. For all these reasons, I strongly urge that
21 Pennsylvania join the RGGI. It is our
22 responsibility.

23 Thank you. I yield my time.

24 MS. SHIRLEY: Thank you, Ella.

25 And last on our list for tonight, we

1 have number 64, Barty Thompson.

2 Do we have Barty on the line?

3 MR. JAGIELA: No, we do not have Barty
4 on the line.

5 MS. SHIRLEY: Did anybody else that
6 was unable --- that we were unable to find earlier
7 contact you, Darek?

8 MR. JAGIELA: No.

9 MS. SHIRLEY: All right.

10 Well, I think that is the end of our
11 testifier list. I would just like to take a moment
12 and thank everyone again for your time and taking
13 your evening to provide comments on this rulemaking.

14 I will note that we had --- because
15 this is our last virtual public hearing for --- for
16 this regulatory package, we've had over 450
17 interested persons and residents of Pennsylvania
18 provide verbal testimony on this rulemaking, which
19 is more than we have had in any other rulemaking.

20 We've listened to over 32 hours of
21 public comment. So I just want to express my
22 sincere appreciation publicly, to Darek Jagiela and
23 Jennifer Swan for being the people behind the screen
24 and behind the telephone and making sure that
25 everyone's voice was heard, so just expressing my

1 appreciation as many of the commenters have
2 expressed.

3 And with no other commenters, on
4 behalf of the EQB, I hereby adjourn this hearing at
5 9:35 p.m.

6 * * * * *

7 HEARING CONCLUDED AT 9:35 P.M.

8 * * * * *

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1 CERTIFICATE

2 I hereby certify that the foregoing proceeding
3 was reported by me on 12/14/2020 and that I, Kelly
4 Gallick, read this transcript, and that I attest that
5 this transcript is a true and accurate record of the
6 proceeding. This notarial act involved the use of
7 communication technology.

8
9 Dated the 19th day of January, 2021

10
11 
12 Kelly Gallick,

13 Court Reporter
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25